

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
Newport News Division

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA )  
 ) CRIMINAL ACTION  
V. )  
 ) NO. 4:11cr112  
KEITH BRENT DUNCAN, )  
 )  
Defendant. )

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Norfolk, Virginia

May 21, 2013

(Sell Hearing)

Before: THE HONORABLE RAYMOND A. JACKSON  
United States District Judge

Appearances:

UNITED STATES ATTORNEY'S OFFICE  
By: DEE M. STERLING, ESQUIRE  
Assistant United States Attorney  
Counsel for the United States

FEDERAL PUBLIC DEFENDER'S OFFICE  
By: PHOENIX A. HARRIS, ESQUIRE  
and  
KAUFMAN & CANOLES  
By: LAUREN B. TALLENT, ESQUIRE  
Counsel for the Defendant

The defendant appearing in person.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

## EXAMINATION INDEX

SONAL PATOLE, M.D.

DIRECT BY MS. STERLING

13

CROSS BY MS. TALLENT

38

REDIRECT BY MS. STERLING

78

JILL C. VOLIN, M.D.

DIRECT BY MS. STERLING

88

CROSS BY MS. HARRIS

125

REDIRECT BY MS. STERLING

146

\* \* \*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

## EXHIBIT INDEX

		MAR	ADM
	<u>Government's</u>		
1,2	Dr. Brauman's Reports	10	10
3,4	Butner Medical Center Reports	10	10
5	Involuntary Medication Report	10	10
7	Dr. Patole's CV	14	14
8	The Sell Effect Article	36	36
9	Dr. Jill Volin's CV	89	89

\* \* \*

1 (Court convened at 10:06 a.m.)

2 THE DEPUTY CLERK: United States of America  
3 versus Keith Brent Duncan, in criminal case 4:11cr112.

4 Ms. Sterling, is the government ready to  
5 proceed?

6 MS. STERLING: The government is ready, Your  
7 Honor.

8 THE COURT: Ms. Harris, Ms. Tallent, is the  
9 defendant ready to proceed?

10 MS. TALLENT: He is. We are ready, Your Honor.  
11 Good morning.

12 THE COURT: All right. Good morning.

13 Ladies and gentlemen, we are here this morning  
14 for the purposes of conducting a hearing pursuant to  
15 *Sell*. I have had an opportunity to read the submissions  
16 of the United States and of the defendant, as well as the  
17 stipulation that the parties have filed in the case.

18 Ms. Sterling, how many witnesses do you intend  
19 to call in this hearing?

20 MS. STERLING: We intend to call two this  
21 morning, Your Honor.

22 THE COURT: Two witnesses.

23 And is the defense potentially calling any  
24 witnesses in this case, Ms. Harris, just to get an idea  
25 of where we are going?

1 MS. HARRIS: Your Honor, at this time we do not  
2 plan to call any witnesses. Mr. Duncan has expressed his  
3 wish to testify, but we have advised him he doesn't have  
4 that right in this capacity and we don't intend to call  
5 him as a witness, Your Honor.

6 THE COURT: Okay. That's fine.

7 Ladies and gentlemen, the Court is prepared to  
8 go forward.

9 Ms. Sterling, are there any preliminaries you  
10 want to address, or do you want to call your first  
11 witness?

12 MS. STERLING: Your Honor, if I might address  
13 the Court briefly.

14 As the Court has indicated, there was a  
15 stipulation filed yesterday. It was the desire of the  
16 government and defense counsel to try to pare this down  
17 to get to the issue at hand, and that is the reason for  
18 the stipulation.

19 The stipulation contains stipulations of fact  
20 and stipulations as to documents that would be used as  
21 exhibits in this case. I would advise the Court first as  
22 to the stipulation of facts. These are facts that were  
23 gleaned from the various reports that the physicians,  
24 these psychiatrists, prepared. So rather than making  
25 reference back and forth to materials contained in the

1 report, we have just set those forth as a stipulation.

2           The stipulation does state the charge, which, as  
3 the Court knows, the defendant was indicted for  
4 possession of a firearm in violation of a protective  
5 order. It states, very briefly, that the evidence of the  
6 government would be that this occurred on September 25th,  
7 2011 at Langley Air Force Base. The defendant approached  
8 the gate about a matter of national security is what he  
9 was claiming. Due to his erratic behavior, officers  
10 requested permission to search his vehicle. That search  
11 produced a shotgun, a box of ammunition, along with  
12 several other articles.

13           Also contained in the stipulation is the fact  
14 that there was a protective order in the case of *Dushan*  
15 *versus Keith Duncan* at the Superior Court for the County  
16 of Cobb, State of Georgia, issued on February 22nd, 2011  
17 to remain effective for a period of one year to February  
18 22nd, 2012, and a finding in that order specifically that  
19 Ms. Dushan was a protected authority pursuant to 18  
20 U.S.C. 922(g). So those are the basic facts underlying  
21 the reason Mr. Duncan is here today.

22           There's also, beyond that in the stipulation,  
23 really just a setting forth of the procedural history in  
24 the case, which I'm sure the Court is aware of.

25           THE COURT: Right.

1 MS. STERLING: But, again, we are just trying to  
2 not have to go over the various matters in this case that  
3 are not really related to the testimony today about the  
4 involuntary medications or the government's motion to  
5 involuntary medicate.

6 Your Honor, as to the exhibits, the government  
7 would like at this time to offer these exhibits and move  
8 them into evidence. As listed in that stipulation to  
9 exhibits, the first four are the reports that the Court  
10 has received, both from Dr. Brauman at MCC and-- two  
11 reports from Dr. Brauman and two reports from the Butner  
12 Medical Center involving the two psychiatrists who are  
13 testifying today.

14 In addition to that, under Stipulation No. 5,  
15 there's an involuntary medication report. I'm not sure  
16 if that was in the Court's file. This was a hearing that  
17 was conducted subsequent to our last appearance before  
18 the Court. It is essentially what's commonly known as a  
19 *Harper* hearing to determine the defendant's dangerousness  
20 in an institutional setting. Defense counsel had asked  
21 that be admitted in evidence, so the government has  
22 included that for that reason.

23 THE COURT: All right.

24 MS. STERLING: And, finally, there is an exhibit  
25 which is a copy of a letter from Mr. Duncan sent to the

1 Court. I assume that is also in the Court's file.

2 That's why it's included, but just for the sake of--

3 THE COURT: Yes, let's do that because right now  
4 the Court has read so much the Court doesn't exactly  
5 recall this Exhibit 6.

6 Do you have it there?

7 MS. STERLING: I do, Your Honor, and it is  
8 addressed to the Court.

9 MS. TALLENT: May we be heard, Your Honor?

10 THE COURT: All right. I was going to ask you  
11 whether you had any objection to any of these exhibits?

12 MS. TALLENT: We do stipulate, Your Honor, as to  
13 their authenticity and agree that they are admitted. We  
14 don't need a custodian for certification. For items 1  
15 through 5 we have no objection.

16 We do have an objection on relevance grounds to  
17 the letter from Mr. Duncan to the Court. We understand  
18 that it has been sent to the Court previously so it may  
19 be in the Court's possession already, but as for it to be  
20 considered as an exhibit or evidence in the context of  
21 the *Sell* hearing, our position is that it does not go to  
22 the factors under *Sell*. That's my stance on that  
23 particular exhibit. The other exhibits, no problem. We  
24 have no problem with them being admitted and considered  
25 by the Court.



1           But I did want to make one more note, Your Honor  
2 just so we are very clear, which is the protective order  
3 that Ms. Sterling mentioned in paragraph 3 of the  
4 stipulation of facts. This was carefully worded between  
5 us that this protective order was issued and was to  
6 remain in effect until February 22nd, 2012, but we are  
7 not conceding that it was in effect on February 22nd,  
8 2012. That would be an issue that could be litigated  
9 still at trial. So we are not conceding that point. We  
10 agree that it was issued and that it was to remain in  
11 effect if it was not canceled in the future.

12           THE COURT: All right. That's a very fine  
13 distinction.

14           MS. HARRIS: I'm sorry, sir?

15           THE COURT: It's a very fine distinction.

16           MS. HARRIS: Yes, sir.

17           THE DEFENDANT: Sir, may I add that it was  
18 canceled July 15th, 2011?

19           THE COURT: Mr. Duncan, in here don't talk  
20 today. Counsel will represent you.

21           THE DEFENDANT: If she can do that for me.

22           THE COURT: All right. Well, let her handle it.  
23 Don't talk out loud like that in here, okay?

24           All right. The Court has it.

25           MS. HARRIS: That was all I had to say, Your

1 Honor.

2 THE COURT: All right. The Court has it.

3 Ms. Sterling, with respect to the letter, the  
4 Court understands what the *Sell* factors are. The Court  
5 doesn't even understand what is in that letter, but the  
6 Court has serious doubt that what's in that letter,  
7 unless the Court can be shown otherwise, has any bearing  
8 on the findings the Court has to make under *Sell*.

9 MS. STERLING: Your Honor, it is the position --  
10 the reason it was offered into evidence is because  
11 there's a lot of reference made about the voluminous  
12 writings of Mr. Duncan. It is illustrative of that. The  
13 government did not want to offer into evidence all these  
14 various writings that had been received by the government  
15 and all sorts of other parties.

16 If there is an objection to that, we can  
17 certainly take it out of the stipulation, but that was  
18 the reason for it. It was the government's understanding  
19 that that was agreeable, but we are not offering it  
20 specifically for the purposes of the Court's  
21 determination under *Sell*.

22 THE COURT: Upon the stipulation of counsel,  
23 Government's Exhibit 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 are admitted.  
24 Exhibit 6 is not admitted.

25 (Government's Exhibits 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 were

1 marked and admitted.)

2 MS. TALLENT: Your Honor, we did want to address  
3 just a couple of other preliminary matters before the  
4 hearing.

5 THE COURT: You may.

6 MS. TALLENT: Thank you, Your Honor.

7 We want to make clear, Your Honor, that we don't  
8 object and we will agree that Drs. Volin and Patole are  
9 experts and are qualified as experts in their fields, and  
10 we have no objection to them being qualified as experts  
11 before the Court today.

12 We would ask that the witnesses be sequestered.  
13 And additionally, Your Honor, because this is a complex  
14 matter-- I mean, there will be a complex argument given  
15 at the end sort of trying to pull the factors together  
16 with the testimony, then we would offer to Your Honor  
17 and, if you would like, we will submit post-hearing  
18 briefings.

19 THE COURT: Okay. The Court certainly can have  
20 the parties submit post-hearing briefings within 30 days  
21 of the date and the time of this hearing to save you the  
22 trouble of arguing. If you believe that that would in  
23 any way assist you, the Court believes it has an  
24 understanding here-- maybe I better wait until the end of  
25 the hearing to determine whether I'm going to request

1 that briefing or not. We are going to do that. We are  
2 simply going to wait.

3 Now, the Court would direct that the witnesses  
4 be sequestered, be separated.

5 Where are they located anyway? Wherever they  
6 are, they need to be sequestered.

7 MS. STERLING: They are testifying via video  
8 conference phone, but, Your Honor, the government's first  
9 witness would be Dr. Patole.

10 THE COURT: Okay. Dr. Patole is your first  
11 witness, then your next witnesses certainly needs to be  
12 sequestered during the testimony of Dr. Patole, and if  
13 you could direct them to do that.

14 I don't know which one is Dr. Patole, so you  
15 will have to--

16 MS. STERLING: Dr. Patole is in the purple  
17 shirt.

18 THE COURT: Okay. Well, then we are going to  
19 have Dr. Volin to step out.

20 MS. STERLING: And Dr. Marra as well, Your  
21 Honor.

22 THE COURT: Okay. Will all witnesses step out  
23 except Dr. Patole.

24 (The witnesses were excused from the courtroom.)

25 THE COURT: All right. Patrice, you may swear

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 her in.

2 (The witness was sworn by the deputy clerk.)

3 THE COURT: You may be seated.

4 SONAL PATOLE, M.D., called as a witness, having  
5 been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as  
6 follows:

7 DIRECT EXAMINATION

8 BY MS. STERLING:

9 Q. If you would, ma'am, please state your full name for  
10 the Court.

11 A. Yes. My name is Sonal Patole. It's spelled  
12 S-o-n-a-l, last name P-a-t-o-l-e.

13 Q. Dr. Patole, how are you employed?

14 A. I am currently a forensic psychiatrist Fellow at UNC  
15 Chapel Hill. As far as my training, I have rotated  
16 through the Butner Medical Center here in Butner.

17 Q. And you are training for what?

18 A. I am a forensic psychiatrist Fellow. I'm currently  
19 under training for a forensic psychiatrist.

20 Q. Okay. And what is your educational background in  
21 the field of forensic psychiatry?

22 A. So after graduating college, I attended medical  
23 school. I graduated from medical school in 2008. After  
24 that I finished a general psychiatry residency in 2012,  
25 and then I joined the forensic psychiatry training

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 program here at UNC Chapel Hill as well.

2 Part of my training involves me rotating through  
3 the state hospitals. That's the Central Regional  
4 Hospital, the North Carolina State Hospital, the Federal  
5 Medical Center, and also the Dorothea Dix Hospital in  
6 Raleigh.

7 Q. Are you still involved in training to be a forensic  
8 psychiatrist?

9 A. Yes, ma'am.

10 Q. Okay. And are you at Butner at this time in your  
11 training?

12 A. I finished my rotation at Butner in December of last  
13 year.

14 MS. STERLING: Okay. I do have for the Court,  
15 Your Honor, and I would move to admit Government's  
16 Exhibit 7, the CV for Dr. Patole. I realize there's been  
17 a stipulation, but I would ask she be qualified as an  
18 expert in forensic psychiatry. I submit that for the  
19 Court's information.

20 THE COURT: Any objection?

21 MS. TALLENT: No objection, Your Honor.

22 THE COURT: Okay. Exhibit 7 will be admitted.

23 (Government's Exhibit 7 was marked and  
24 admitted.)

25 BY MS. STERLING:

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 Q. In your course of rotation at Butner, did you have  
2 occasion to evaluate Keith Duncan?

3 A. Yes, I did.

4 Q. Are you having trouble hearing me?

5 A. A little bit, but I think we can manage.

6 Q. All right. I will try to speak a little more  
7 slowly.

8 Are you able to see the courtroom to see that  
9 Mr. Duncan is here today?

10 A. I am not able to see Mr. Duncan. He's not on the  
11 screen for me.

12 THE COURT: What can she see?

13 THE WITNESS: I can see yourself and also  
14 Ms. Sterling, and the court reporter.

15 Yes, I see Mr. Duncan. He's the gentleman  
16 waving at me.

17 MS. STERLING: All right. If the record could  
18 reflect that the witness has identified the defendant,  
19 Your Honor.

20 THE COURT: The record will so reflect.

21 MS. STERLING: Thank you.

22 BY MS. STERLING:

23 Q. And what was the purpose of your evaluation?

24 A. Mr. Duncan was admitted to FMC on the 19th of July  
25 of last year. On admission he received both a medical

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 evaluation and a psychiatric evaluation, just on the  
2 intake.

3 As far as the medical evaluation, he received  
4 basic labs and also he received a full medical and  
5 physical exam. The intake was done by Dr. Volin. And  
6 subsequent to that when I joined the facility as part of  
7 my training, I interacted with Mr. Duncan at least on a  
8 weekly basis while I was here, and it involved extensive  
9 interviews ranging anywhere from between 15 and 45  
10 minutes on a weekly basis.

11 It also involved a gathering of collaterals on  
12 both the AUSA and also from medical records, also  
13 information from his family. We also had consulted with  
14 Dr. Dillon Grant, who is a psychologist at FMC.

15 Q. Okay. And do you know why Mr. Duncan was admitted  
16 to Butner in July of 2012?

17 A. Yes. Under Section 4241 he was admitted to Butner  
18 for competency restoration and evaluation of competency  
19 to stand trial.

20 Q. Okay. And was that pursuant to a court order?

21 A. Yes, ma'am. It was a court order.

22 Q. All right. Now, you indicated that you met many  
23 times with Mr. Duncan. Can you tell us approximately  
24 how many times you met with him in the course of your  
25 evaluation?



S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 A. I met with him at least on a weekly basis. So at  
2 least 12, 13 times that I was here I have had occasion  
3 to meet with him, if not more.

4 Q. All right. And how would you describe his demeanor  
5 and his conduct during those meetings?

6 A. Mr. Duncan is a very nice fellow. He's an  
7 intelligent person. He was cooperative with the  
8 examination, but when we would attempt to try to talk  
9 about his legal issues and his current evaluation he  
10 would become easily agitated and, therefore, at times I  
11 had to terminate interviews due to that agitation.

12 Q. And what do you mean about the agitation, what  
13 specifically?

14 A. When he would discuss his legal issues, he would  
15 repeatedly try to assert that the reason for him being  
16 here was part of a conspiracy. For example, if we were  
17 to talk about, you know, as far as the competency  
18 evaluation, what the role of the lawyer was, he knew  
19 what his defense attorney was supposed to do, but then  
20 the conversation would derail into how his attorney is  
21 involved in the conspiracy and then it would further  
22 derail into encompassing other folks in the institution  
23 and outside of the institution, and kind of just sort of  
24 postulating about why these folks are after him and are  
25 involved in a conspiracy.

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1           He would have to be redirected to talk about the  
2     issue at hand. His volume would increase, the rate of  
3     his speech would increase, and he would become-- he  
4     would physically become agitated. So that's why we  
5     would have to terminate the interview.

6     Q. Did you terminate the interview after trying to  
7     redirect him?

8     A. I'm sorry. Can you repeat the question, please?

9     Q. Did you try to redirect his focus before  
10    terminating?

11    A. Yes. I would try several times. I think we would  
12    try-- you know, I tried several approaches with him to  
13    redirect him to the issue at hand, but I was often  
14    unsuccessful.

15    Q. Okay. And I believe you indicated that because you  
16    were a Fellow, you were supervised by a staff in your  
17    evaluation; is that correct?

18    A. Yes. I was supervised by Dr. Volin.

19    Q. That's Dr. Jill Volin?

20    A. Yes, ma'am.

21    Q. Okay. And I believe you touched on this also, but  
22    in addition to your interviews with Mr. Duncan, what, if  
23    any, other sources of information did you use in  
24    performing your evaluation?

25    A. The other sources we used were medical records that

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 we obtained from Peachford Hospital in Atlanta. We also  
2 contacted his family members for information. We also  
3 reviewed material from his previous evaluation in New  
4 York, and we also reviewed any other Bureau of Prisons  
5 records that were available. We also reviewed incident  
6 and witness reports that were forwarded to us regarding  
7 the alleged offense.

8 Q. Okay. You indicated you reviewed medical records  
9 from Peachtree (sic.). What did those entail?

10 A. I believe it's Peachford Hospital. It was a  
11 involuntary psychiatric admission that was done for  
12 Mr. Duncan in the past, and we obtained those records.

13 Q. Okay. Based on your evaluation, including a review  
14 of the documents you have indicated and your interviews  
15 with Mr. Duncan, did you form a medical opinion with a  
16 reasonable degree of certainty as to whether he suffers  
17 from a mental disease or defect?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Okay. And what is your opinion?

20 A. He has schizoaffective disorder.

21 Q. Okay. And could you tell us briefly what you mean  
22 by that? What is schizoaffective disorder?

23 A. Sure. So schizoaffective disorder is the type of  
24 disorder that has symptoms both of a mood disorder,  
25 which is bipolar disorder, and also symptoms of a

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 psychotic disorder, which is schizophrenia.

2           So with schizophrenia a person usually  
3 experiences delusions or hallucinations. Delusions are  
4 fake, false beliefs, and hallucinations meaning hearing  
5 things that no one else can hear or seeing things that  
6 no one else can see.

7           Bipolar disorder is more of a cyclical  
8 disorder. You see symptoms of mania, which is when  
9 folks have deeper sleep, they talk really fast, they are  
10 disorganized, and that's a manic episode. They can also  
11 experience a depressive episode.

12           But schizoaffective disorder is a combination of  
13 both schizophrenia and bipolar disorder. So  
14 schizoaffective disorder you have the cyclical nature of  
15 the illness, whereas on occasion the patient experiences  
16 manic episodes and also can experience depressive  
17 episodes later on. But in between episodes they still  
18 have the psychotic symptoms.

19           In bipolar disorder you have the episodes of  
20 mania and depression, but in between those episodes the  
21 patient is symptom free. In schizoaffective disorder  
22 that's not the case. You have the episodes, but in  
23 between those episodes the patient doesn't have  
24 psychotic symptoms present but the delusions present.

25 Q. So in schizoaffective disorder, as I understand what

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 you are saying, there was never a time when the person  
2 diagnosed is asymptomatic; is that correct?

3 A. That is correct.

4 Q. Are there different types of schizoaffective  
5 disorder?

6 A. Yes. Schizoaffective disorder bipolar type, and  
7 there is schizoaffective disorder disorganized.

8 Q. Did you diagnose Mr. Duncan, the defendant, as  
9 having a particular type of schizoaffective?

10 A. We diagnosed him with schizoaffective disorder  
11 bipolar type.

12 Q. Now, you have described for us what that diagnosis  
13 entails as far as symptoms, but can you tell us  
14 specifically why you diagnosed Mr. Duncan with  
15 schizoaffective disorder bipolar type?

16 A. Sure. Mr. Duncan, he was initially hospitalized in  
17 Arizona, I believe, in '98 and during that time we were  
18 not able to get the records, but his wife described him  
19 as having a manic attack.

20 After that he was again hospitalized where he  
21 was seen to have manic symptoms, and that's when he was  
22 admitted at Peachford Hospital.

23 During that hospitalization the description,  
24 basically, on his admission note stated that he had this  
25 paranoid belief that his wife was trying to kill him.

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 He was described as floridly manic, very paranoid,  
2 delusional and grandiose. He was treated and  
3 discharged.

4 Again, he was seen by Dr. Hege, and he also  
5 noted episodes of Mr. Duncan being hypomanic or manic.  
6 That's how he was described.

7 More importantly, even within these periods  
8 where it appears that he was having these psychotic  
9 episodes, there was instances where he was just having  
10 psychotic symptoms.

11 His son-- his family provided to us that even  
12 when he was less manic, he would have thoughts such as  
13 he had the ability to control things with his mind,  
14 which they were delusions.

15 Also, when he was arrested after-- when he was  
16 under observation with Dr. Brauman, he was noted to  
17 require very little sleep, he was always irritable,  
18 grandiose, demanding, symptoms you see in mania.

19 While he has been here, we have not seen him as  
20 manic, but what we have seen is that he continues to  
21 have the delusional beliefs regarding Mr. Rose and  
22 Ms. Bashama, which he's had these symptoms throughout  
23 his illness. He has not really shown us that he has the  
24 manic symptoms, but that's why we diagnosed him as  
25 having the schizoaffective disorder because he has the

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 cyclical episodes of mania, but also being psychotic.

2 Q. Just for those of us who are not psychiatrists, when  
3 you say someone is manic or hypomanic, what do you mean  
4 by those terms?

5 A. So when I describe somebody as manic, it's somebody  
6 who has a lot of energy but they really don't require  
7 any sleep. They have decreased need of sleep and they  
8 will not feel tired. They will be able to do multiple  
9 things and they start multiple things, but don't finish  
10 them. Their thoughts can be disorganized. Their  
11 speech, we call it, can be uninterpretable. He's  
12 talking. It's hard to interrupt and put any suggestions  
13 in there.

14 They also have impulsive behaviors such as, you  
15 know, driving fast or using substances. They can also  
16 have psychotic symptoms such as paranoid delusions or  
17 delusions of grandeur. So that's what a manic episode  
18 looks like.

19 Q. What about hypomania? You used that term. How is  
20 that different from manic or mania?

21 A. So mania means-- usually the symptoms I mentioned  
22 earlier, they last for either a week or less than a week  
23 if the person needed hospitalization. But in hypomania,  
24 they have the same degree of-- in hypomania, we have  
25 somebody who does require less sleep, but their thoughts

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 might not be quite as disorganized. They might have a  
2 lot more energy, but they will at times feel tired. The  
3 symptoms only last for about four days. The person does  
4 not experience any psychotic symptoms. Their life is  
5 not impaired by these symptoms to the point that they  
6 need hospitalization. So hypomania is kind of a baby  
7 mania, basically. There are symptoms, but to a much  
8 lesser degree and no psychotic.

9 Q. Okay. Thank you for that explanation.

10 Dr. Patole, based on your evaluation, did you  
11 prepare a report containing your diagnosis?

12 A. Yes, we did.

13 Q. In fact, weren't there two reports prepared in  
14 Mr. Duncan's case?

15 A. Yes, there were two reports. Yes.

16 Q. Just for the record, those reports were prepared in  
17 September of 2012 and December 2012; is that correct?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. And in your report --

20 Your Honor, those are moved into admission as  
21 Government's No. 3 and 4.

22 THE COURT: They have been admitted.

23 MS. STERLING: Thank you, Your Honor.

24 BY MS. STERLING:

25 Q. In your report, in addition to your diagnosis, did



S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 you address the issue of Mr. Duncan's competence to  
2 stand trial?

3 A. Yes, we did.

4 Q. And did you form an opinion as to whether he was  
5 competent to stand trial?

6 A. Yes. I believe that Mr. Duncan is currently not  
7 competent, based on the information I have, to stand  
8 trial.

9 Q. Okay. When you say currently, you mean as of the  
10 dates of those two reports; is that correct?

11 A. Yes. As of the date of those reports he was not  
12 competent to stand trial, correct?

13 Q. And you would state that with a reasonable degree of  
14 medical certainty; is that correct?

15 A. That is correct.

16 Q. Okay. Does your report indicate a medical opinion  
17 as to whether there's a substantial likelihood that  
18 Mr. Duncan's competence could be restored with  
19 appropriate treatment?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And, again, can you state an opinion with a  
22 reasonable degree of medical certainty as to whether he  
23 could be restored?

24 A. I believe Mr. Duncan can be restored within a  
25 reasonable medical certainty.

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 Q. Okay. And what do you base that opinion on?

2 A. So Mr. Duncan has in the past, he has a history of  
3 being noncompliant. But we do know that when he was at  
4 Peachford Hospital he was treated, and compared to when  
5 he was admitted to the hospital where he was described  
6 as floridly manic and delusional and so forth, with  
7 treatment his mental status improved. And based on that  
8 window, we know that medications are effective in  
9 treating his symptoms.

10 There's also a lot of data that support that  
11 people with similar symptoms as Mr. Duncan have been  
12 restored to competency with treatment.

13 Q. Okay. And you say you reviewed the records of  
14 Peachford. What was he treated with at Peachford?

15 A. He was treated with Abilify at Peachford.

16 Q. What is Abilify?

17 A. Abilify is an antipsychotic medication.

18 Q. And how is that medication administered?

19 A. Can you repeat the question?

20 Q. How is that administered?

21 A. That was administered orally.

22 Q. Okay. So you based your opinion on his personal  
23 record, studies of similarly situated people, and your  
24 just basic understanding of his situation; is that  
25 correct?

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 A. I'm sorry, I didn't hear that last part.

2 Q. So in your opinion he could be restored based on his  
3 history and studies or things that you know about  
4 similarly situated persons; is that correct?

5 A. That is correct.

6 Q. All right. And in the report or in both of the  
7 reports did you outline a treatment plan that was  
8 designed to restore Mr. Duncan's competence?

9 A. Yes, we did.

10 Q. Okay. And did that plan entail the use of  
11 psychotropic medications?

12 A. Yes, it does.

13 Q. And what type of medications did you recommend in  
14 the report as far as would be needed to treat or best  
15 treat Mr. Duncan?

16 A. So the proposed treatment plan would be-- well,  
17 first of all, we would like for Mr. Duncan to  
18 participate in the treatment, so that would be to give  
19 us the permission to treat him voluntarily because it  
20 would allow us to sit down with Mr. Duncan and, you  
21 know, show him the order and discuss the various options  
22 he has in terms of taking medications orally versus  
23 injectable medications. We would prefer to use oral  
24 medications if he is amenable to be treated. You know,  
25 we have several medications available to us.

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1           There are older medications which we call  
2       typical medications or typical antipsychotics and newer  
3       ones which we call atypical antipsychotics. Some of the  
4       older medications are alda corphenadene, and the newer  
5       medications are Risperdal, Abilify, Zyprexa, and so  
6       forth. So we would sit down with him, talk to him about  
7       the risks and benefit of each medication and, you know,  
8       we would work with him to make a choice. Abilify is  
9       also one of the newer medications, and that's also  
10      available to us to administer.

11           Were Mr. Duncan not wanting to participate in  
12      his treatment plan, we do have available injectable  
13      antipsychotics. Haldol, Perphenazine are available.  
14      And also Zyprexa, which is a newer antipsychotic  
15      medication, that's available as well. And we would have  
16      administered them intramuscularly, and you would take  
17      appropriate institution measures to ensure safety in  
18      administering those medications?

19      Q.    These medications would be injected only if  
20      Mr. Duncan would not agree to take medications orally;  
21      is that correct?

22      A.    That is correct.

23      Q.    Has Mr. Duncan taken medications or been offered  
24      medications orally, psychotropic medications, while at  
25      Butner?

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 A. Yes, he was. When he initially came here, he was  
2 offered an oral trial of Risperdal. He took maybe one  
3 or two doses but then complained about side effects, and  
4 later on said he had actually not taken the  
5 medications. A search of his cell was done, and I  
6 believe two Risperdal pills were found that he had not  
7 taken.

8 Q. And does your review of the medical history of  
9 Mr. Duncan, including his prior treatment at Peachford  
10 and with other psychiatrists or healthcare  
11 professionals, indicate his compliance with oral  
12 medication?

13 A. He has-- as I mentioned earlier, he has been mostly  
14 noncompliant in the past. The only time that he would  
15 let me know he was truly treated was when he was at  
16 Peachford, and that was in a hospitalized setting.

17 Q. As far as medications that might be used for  
18 involuntarily medicating the defendant, does the  
19 treatment plan suggest a number of different medications  
20 and what, if any, is the order of preference?

21 A. The treatment plan does talk about different  
22 medications. We would be able to offer him the newer  
23 medications that I mentioned: Risperdal, Zyprexa and  
24 Abilify. We would monitor him for any side effects, and  
25 again, we would be able to discuss the risks and

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 benefits and monitor, you know, what type of side  
2 effects, if any, he's having.

3 Q. Okay. And what about the plan for Haldol and other  
4 medications to be injected, if necessary?

5 A. If Mr. Duncan declines medication, declines  
6 treatment, we would start with Haldol, which is an  
7 injectable medication and one of the older medications.  
8 We would start with like 5 milligrams intramuscularly  
9 every day and then monitor how he's doing.

10 Q. And does the plan also indicate the dosage amount,  
11 the frequency, and the amount of time you believe would  
12 be necessary before it became effective in making him  
13 competent or rendering him competent again?

14 A. The plan does suggest some dosages of the  
15 medications. I believe you have outlined those on page  
16 33 of the report. They include Haldol, 5 milligrams  
17 intramuscularly.

18 Q. The plan, in fact, is a suggested dosage frequency  
19 and amount necessary for restoration of the three  
20 suggested injectable medications; is that correct?

21 A. That is correct.

22 Q. All right. Does the plan also set forth for the  
23 Court the potential side effects of the medications  
24 suggested?

25 A. Yes. The report does contain information about the

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 side effects.

2 Q. If you would, could you tell us briefly what those  
3 potential side effects are and what, if any, measures  
4 are set forth in the plan to deal with those?

5 A. Okay. The three main side effects that would be of  
6 concern would be, first, primarily vision, especially  
7 Mr. Duncan, you know, wanting to be able to participate  
8 in his legal defense.

9 But, again, the patient will be monitored, and  
10 you are going to start at a very low dose and then  
11 increase the medication as needed, but at the same time  
12 you are going to balance it with the need for him to be  
13 alert. Usually the side effect of sedation lessens the  
14 more the patient is on the medication.

15 Also, the other side effects are movement  
16 disorders. Sometimes initially they will experience  
17 stiffness and that can be treated, what we call  
18 Parkinsonism, and that could be treated with medications  
19 like Cogentin, and also the other movement disorder that  
20 we worry about is a long-term movement disorder called  
21 Tardive Dyskinesia, which is abnormal movements that  
22 occur after a person has been on an antipsychotic  
23 medication for a long time. So that side effect is  
24 something that has to be monitored for long term and  
25 it's unlikely that we will see it within the time frame

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 that we will be monitoring Mr. Duncan.

2 And lastly, the last side effect of concern is  
3 what we call metabolic syndrome. Metabolic syndrome is  
4 a tendency for, especially the newer medications, to  
5 cause folks to gain weight, develop diabetes, have  
6 increased cholesterol, and so forth. That is something  
7 that would need to be monitored on a periodic basis.  
8 Mr. Duncan would have to agree for us to do lab work in  
9 order to monitor for those things.

10 We would measure his pituitary, his lipids on a  
11 regular basis to make sure-- see how he was doing. His  
12 weight would also be monitored on a regular basis.

13 Q. And are there also, or is there not, as indicated in  
14 the report, a possibility of very severe, in rare cases,  
15 very severe side effects?

16 A. Yes. The very severe side effect is what we call a  
17 neuroleptic malignant syndrome. That is when a person  
18 becomes confused, develops a fever, and so forth. But  
19 again, this is something that we monitor for, and the  
20 way we avoid it is we start low and increase the  
21 medication slowly.

22 Q. And does the report indicate or do you have an  
23 opinion as to what the likelihood is of any severe side  
24 effects of the medications outlined?

25 A. Let me refer to my report for a second.



S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 Q. Yes, ma'am.

2 A. So the estimated rate of neuroleptic malignant  
3 syndrome is somewhere from .07 percent to 2 percent for  
4 an individual treated with antipsychotic medication. So  
5 that would be, at the most, two out of a hundred  
6 patients would experience it, or at least seven out of a  
7 thousand.

8 Q. Are there any others there that you-- any other  
9 severe effects?

10 A. I'm sorry?

11 Q. I'm sorry. Does the report list any other severe  
12 side effects and the potential of their occurrence?

13 A. There's also because recently there has been what we  
14 call a black box warning with antipsychotic medication,  
15 it has been known to cause cardiac arrhythmia or causing  
16 the heart to beat in an abnormal way, and this is a very  
17 rare side effect. This cardiac arrhythmia can lead to  
18 sudden death. The incidents for that in a general adult  
19 population is somewhere between 7 events per 10,000  
20 persons to 10 to 12 events per 10,000 persons.

21 Q. Okay. In the medications, does the treatment plan  
22 suggest that the Haldol, the Perphenazine and Risperdal,  
23 is there a difference amongst them the likelihood of any  
24 of these side effects?

25 A. So the side effects that I mentioned earlier, the

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1     Parkinsonism side effects or the stiffness that I  
2     mentioned earlier, it's more likely to occur with the  
3     older medications, and the older medications are also  
4     more likely to cause the Tardive Dyskinesia or the  
5     abnormal movements that I talked about earlier. So  
6     Haldol or Perphenazine are the older medications and  
7     there's a higher incidence of those causing the movement  
8     side effects.

9             Risperdal is a newer medication. It's more  
10     likely to cause the metabolic syndrome that I mentioned  
11     earlier, causing folks to gain weight and so forth. The  
12     older medications and newer medications have a different  
13     side effect profile.

14            As far as the neuroleptic malignant syndrome and  
15     cardiac arrhythmia, the literature, I believe, says that  
16     all the older and the newer medications have pretty much  
17     the same incidence of those occurring.

18     Q. All right. So by way of summary, the report  
19     outlines all of the potential side effects and a plan  
20     for dealing with them through monitoring and treatment;  
21     is that correct?

22     A. That is correct.

23     Q. All right. Now, you have indicated that you believe  
24     the treatment plan outlined in the report is  
25     substantially likely to return Mr. Duncan to competence;

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 is that correct?

2 A. That is correct.

3 Q. And if you could, just tell the Court briefly why do  
4 you believe that to be the case, that this treatment  
5 plan will restore him to competence for the purposes of  
6 proceeding in this matter?

7 A. We are basing that on some of the competency  
8 maturation data that is already out there. There have  
9 been two studies published in 1993 where there were 61  
10 incompetent folks and they were involuntarily treated in  
11 the state of New York and 89 percent of them were able  
12 to be restored to competency.

13 More recently in 2012, actually here at FMC  
14 Butner, Drs. Herbel, Cochrane, Reardon and Lloyd  
15 published a paper which basically looked at 132 folks  
16 who were incompetent and were involuntarily treated  
17 under *Sell* and were able to restore 70 plus percent of  
18 them to competency.

19 Q. Okay. What was the name of that study, I'm sorry,  
20 just to make that clear for the record?

21 A. It's on page 22. It's the study by Drs. Cochrane,  
22 Herbel, Reardon, and Lloyd. It was done in 2012. It's  
23 mentioned in the last paragraph.

24 MS. STERLING: Your Honor, I do have a copy of  
25 that study. Counsel has it also. I would mark it and

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 provide it for the Court as an exhibit, if that's  
2 agreeable.

3 THE COURT: Any objection?

4 MS. TALLENT: No objection, Your Honor.

5 THE COURT: All right.

6 MS. STERLING: I am marking a document entitled  
7 "The Sell Effect: Involuntary medication treatment is a  
8 clear and convincing success." Offered by Cochrane,  
9 Herbel, Reardon and Lloyd, as described by the witness.  
10 It is marked as Government's Exhibit 8, and we would move  
11 for its admission, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: All right. It will be admitted.

13 (Government's Exhibit No. 8 was marked and  
14 admitted.)

15 BY MS. STERLING:

16 Q. So in addition to research which would indicate to  
17 you that the treatment plan would restore Mr. Duncan  
18 to-- or would be substantially likely to restore  
19 Mr. Duncan to competence, is there any other factor that  
20 you want to share with the Court as far as what leads  
21 you to that opinion?

22 A. Again, when Mr. Duncan was treated at the Peachford  
23 Hospital, he responded positively to antipsychotic  
24 medication treatment, and that tells me that he will  
25 more than likely be able to be treated with

S. Patole, M.D. - Direct

1 antipsychotic medication again and get benefit from it.

2 Q. Okay. And Dr. Patole, do you have an expert opinion  
3 or opinion with a reasonable degree of medical certainty  
4 as to whether Mr. Duncan's competence could be restored  
5 without medication?

6 A. In my opinion his competency will not be restored  
7 without medication. Mr. Duncan has been without-- the  
8 evidence for that is Mr. Duncan has been without  
9 medication for the last year or more than a year as he's  
10 been in observation and his symptoms have not  
11 retracted. He continues to have the psychotic beliefs  
12 that are interfering with his ability to work with his  
13 attorney in a meaningful way.

14 Q. When was the last time you evaluated or saw  
15 Mr. Duncan in a professional capacity?

16 A. I met with Mr. Duncan, I think it was, mid-December  
17 of 2012.

18 Q. All right. And is there anything in the two  
19 reports, the September report and the December report  
20 that's been filed with the Court, or any of your  
21 observations, or any of those facts or any of your  
22 opinions different today than what was expressed in  
23 those reports when you wrote them?

24 A. No.

25 MS. STERLING: Thank you very much, Dr. Patole.

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 THE COURT: Cross-examination?

2 MS. TALLENT: Yes, Your Honor.

3 Before we start, Your Honor, we just wanted to  
4 clarify that the exhibits that have already been  
5 admitted, those will be under seal; is that correct?

6 THE COURT: Yes.

7 MS. TALLENT: Okay.

8 CROSS-EXAMINATION

9 BY MS. TALLENT:

10 Q. Good morning, Dr. Patole. My name is Lauren Tallent  
11 Rogers. I represent the defense.

12 A. Good morning.

13 Q. I would like to start with your certification. I  
14 would just like to clarify at the time you wrote the  
15 report, originally in September and then the addendum in  
16 December, you were not Board certified by the American  
17 Board of Psychiatry and Neurology as a forensic  
18 psychiatrist?

19 A. I had taken my board examination in mid-September.  
20 So by the time we issued our first report I had not  
21 heard back from the board, but the second time when we  
22 submitted the second report I had received my board  
23 report and at that point I was Board certified.

24 Q. So at the time you wrote the report, you explained  
25 you were participating in this fellowship in training?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. I'm sorry. Can you repeat the question again?

2 Q. So at the time you wrote the report, you were  
3 participating in training for a forensic psychiatry  
4 program; is that right?

5 A. That is correct.

6 Q. Okay. And did your fellowship start roughly around  
7 July of 2012?

8 A. Yes, it did.

9 Q. Okay. So that's approximately two months before you  
10 submitted the original report in September?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Okay. And so was this the first time that you had  
13 dealt with forced medication in the Bureau of Prisons  
14 context?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And Dr. Volin supervised your evaluation?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. But she wasn't present during all of your  
19 interaction with Mr. Duncan?

20 A. No.

21 Q. And there were times Dr. Volin met with Mr. Duncan  
22 without you?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. But you wrote the report and the addendum that are  
25 before the Court today?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. I'm sorry. Can you repeat that last part again?

2 Q. Yes. You, yourself, drafted the report and the  
3 addendum that are before the Court today?

4 A. The addendum-- I wrote the initial report, but the  
5 addendum was primarily written by Dr. Volin.

6 Q. Okay. Would you agree that the ultimate diagnosis  
7 of schizoaffective disorder was yours?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And, again, just to clarify, your fellowship with  
10 Butner ended in December of 2012, so you are no longer  
11 with FMC Butner?

12 A. I am not. I am rotating to other sites.

13 Q. Okay. I would like to talk a little bit about your  
14 diagnosis now.

15 So you diagnosed Mr. Duncan with schizoaffective  
16 disorder?

17 A. Um-hum, correct.

18 Q. I assume you are aware that all of Mr. Duncan's past  
19 doctors have diagnosed him with some form of bipolar  
20 disorder and not with schizoaffective disorder?

21 A. That is correct. As I mentioned earlier, there's a  
22 lot of overlap between bipolar disorder and  
23 schizoaffective disorder. We, fortunately, have the  
24 benefit of time. We have had a longer time to observe  
25 his symptoms.



S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. Okay. Just to kind of walk through them  
2 specifically, Dr. Hege who treated Mr. Duncan off and on  
3 from 2008 to 2011, he diagnosed Mr. Duncan with "Rule  
4 out bipolar disorder"; is that correct?

5 A. Correct. That is one of the diagnoses, yes.

6 Q. And at Charter Peachford Hospital where he was  
7 involuntarily committed for a short period of time, they  
8 diagnosed him with bipolar disorder, most recent episode  
9 manic with psychotic symptoms; is that correct?

10 A. That is correct.

11 Q. And then Dr. Brauman, who was the BOP appointed  
12 psychologist that gave the competency evaluation  
13 submitted to the Court, she diagnosed Mr. Duncan with  
14 bipolar type I, severe with psychotic features; is that  
15 correct?

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. And the report itself seems to imply that Dr. Volin  
18 initially diagnosed Duncan with bipolar disorder. On  
19 page 15 of your report it says that she informed him she  
20 was treating him for bipolar disorder; is that correct?

21 A. On page 15 of my report?

22 Q. It mentions that Dr. Volin informed Mr. Duncan she  
23 was treating him for bipolar disorder.

24 A. Yes, that is what Dr. Robbins' recommendations are.

25 Q. And so you would agree that you are the only doctor

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 to have ever diagnosed Mr. Duncan with schizoaffective  
2 disorder?

3 A. As I mentioned earlier, I have had the advantage of  
4 looking at Mr. Duncan over a period of time rather than  
5 as a set period of time. Dr. Hege when he was seeing  
6 Mr. Duncan-- first of all, Mr. Duncan was noncompliant  
7 with his medication and there were large periods when  
8 there were relapses in between visits. So Dr. Hege  
9 would not know how Mr. Duncan was doing.

10 The second thing is, you know, again, when he  
11 was seen at Peachford Hospital, it was like one  
12 snapshot. It was kind of like seeing an entire movie  
13 versus seeing one scene of a movie. You can't really  
14 judge as to what was going on in the entire movie based  
15 on one scene.

16 Again, as far as Dr. Robbins' diagnosis, when  
17 she saw him, he was having symptoms that were consistent  
18 with mania, but his symptoms have evolved over time and  
19 we have seen him not manic but still psychotic.

20 Q. I understand. But just to clarify, you are the only  
21 doctor to have ever diagnosed Mr. Duncan with  
22 schizoaffective disorder?

23 A. That is correct.

24 Q. And you are obviously familiar with DSM-IV, so  
25 that's what you based your diagnosis on?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. Um-hum, correct.

2 Q. And you are familiar with DSM-IV's criteria as it  
3 relates to schizoaffective disorder?

4 A. Um-hum.

5 Q. And as you begin to describe here, one of those  
6 criteria for schizoaffective disorder is observation of  
7 delusions for at least two weeks and absent of prominent  
8 mania symptoms?

9 A. That's correct.

10 Q. And the report states that you base this observation  
11 on conversations with family members; is that correct?

12 A. Yes, but I could clarify further. It was not only  
13 based on the information we got from the family, but  
14 also our observations here. He was not manic when he  
15 was here, but he was still psychotic for more than two  
16 weeks while at FMC Butner. So it was more than just the  
17 family report.

18 Q. Your report never mentioned observation of  
19 Mr. Duncan without having mania, does it?

20 A. It does. I think if you look through the exam  
21 again, you will see that there are times where he was  
22 able to-- he was not manic but still psychotic.

23 Q. If you could point to the page in the report, that  
24 would be great, because it does not appear the report  
25 ever mentioned a description of Mr. Duncan not being

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 manic. In fact, on page 16 of your report you note that  
2 he often had both manic and psychotic symptoms.

3 A. Let me look at my report, and I will let you know.  
4 One second.

5 THE COURT: What page of the report are you  
6 asking her to look to?

7 MS. TALLENT: This report is the addendum dated  
8 December 17, 2012.

9 THE COURT: Exhibit 4?

10 MS. TALLENT: Exhibit 4, yes, Your Honor.

11 BY MS. TALLENT:

12 Q. Dr. Patole, I will go ahead and move on.

13 A. Okay.

14 Q. In terms of your conversations with Mr. Duncan's  
15 family, did you personally talk to his family?

16 A. No, Dr. Volin did.

17 Q. Okay. So a second requirement for schizoaffective  
18 disorder-- in addition to observing him have delusions  
19 without mania, a second requirement is that you must  
20 show a manic episode concurrent with symptoms that meet  
21 criterion A for schizophrenia; is that correct?

22 A. Um-hum.

23 Q. So--

24 A. That is correct.

25 Q. So DSM-IV, when you are diagnosing schizoaffective

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 disorder, takes you over to look at schizophrenia in  
2 criterion A?

3 A. Uh-huh.

4 Q. Particularly, this is on page 12 of DSM-IV, it lists  
5 under criterion A that you have to have some combination  
6 of the following: Disorganized speech, grossly  
7 disorganized or catatonic behavior, negative symptoms  
8 such as affective flattening or bazaar delusions.

9 A. Um-hum.

10 Q. And he has to have at least one of those things  
11 concurrent with his manic episodes and concurrent with  
12 his delusions; is that right?

13 A. I'm sorry. Say the last part again, please.

14 Q. He has to experience at least one of those list of  
15 things concurrent with his manic episode and concurrent  
16 with his delusions?

17 A. Are you saying that he needs to have one of these  
18 criterion A symptoms, the delusions, hallucinations, and  
19 so forth, during a manic episode?

20 Q. Yes.

21 A. Yes. He can have psychotic symptoms during a manic  
22 episode, yes. I'm not sure I'm understanding your  
23 question, frankly.

24 Q. I will rephrase it.

25 Nowhere in your report do you describe Mr. Duncan as

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 having bazaar delusions, disorganized speech,  
2 disorganized or catatonic behavior, or negative symptoms  
3 such as affective flattening?

4 A. Part of the reports we received from his family,  
5 Mr. Duncan did believe he could control things with his  
6 mind, which I would classify as a bazaar delusion.

7 Q. Okay. But you personally have not experienced or  
8 observed Mr. Duncan having bazaar delusions. His  
9 delusions are, at least the majority, based in real  
10 life, based in fact.

11 A. I mean, they are probable; but, no, they are not--

12 Q. They involve real characters.

13 A. I'm sorry?

14 Q. You would agree they involve real actors, real  
15 people that exist in real life?

16 A. He had beliefs about real people, yes.

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. But they are delusions.

19 Q. So just to clarify, your basis for criterion A is  
20 that he has bazaar delusions?

21 A. I would classify being able to control things with  
22 your mind as a bazaar delusion, yes.

23 Q. Okay. But you didn't personally observe that?

24 A. No, I did not.

25 Q. Okay. So working with your diagnosis of

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 schizoaffective disorder, delusions or hallucinations  
2 are one of the main characteristics; is that correct?

3 A. That's correct.

4 Q. But as we have seen from the past diagnoses of other  
5 doctors, delusions can also be a feature of bipolar  
6 disorder?

7 A. That's correct.

8 Q. And those are not the only mental illnesses that can  
9 feature delusions; is that correct?

10 A. That's correct.

11 Q. In fact, there's delusional disorder?

12 A. You can have delusional disorder, yes.

13 Q. And just because one has a particular mental  
14 diagnosis doesn't mean that they cannot have a second  
15 mental diagnosis at the same time. That's why we have  
16 Axis I, Axis II; is that correct?

17 A. No, actually Axis I is where you would list all of  
18 the mental health issues. Axis II is for different  
19 personality disorders. The system does not  
20 differentiate that as Axis I diagnosis and Axis II is  
21 another diagnosis, no.

22 Q. Great. You can have more than one diagnosis at the  
23 same time?

24 A. Yes, you can.

25 Q. So it's possible to have both a mood disorder and a

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 delusional disorder?

2 A. You are right, it's possible. But in Mr. Duncan's  
3 case, that's not the case.

4 Q. So it's possible, just like you said, that  
5 Mr. Duncan's delusions could be a result of his bipolar  
6 or his schizoaffective, but it's also possible they  
7 could be a result of delusional disorder?

8 A. As I said, you could be right, but that's not the  
9 case in Mr. Duncan's situation.

10 Q. Schizoaffective disorder typically occurs or begins  
11 early in life; is that right?

12 A. There's a range and there's always people who fall  
13 on either side of the range, yes, but it typically  
14 starts from young adulthood.

15 Q. I'm sorry. So you agree the typical onset is early  
16 in life?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Mr. Duncan is currently 54 years old. It appears  
19 his symptoms began to appear in his late 40s. Does that  
20 sound correct?

21 A. That is correct.

22 Q. And delusional disorder typically has an onset later  
23 in life, would you agree?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. But delusional disorder is never discussed in your



S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 report, is it?

2 A. As I mentioned earlier, Mr. Duncan's situation does  
3 not warrant a delusional disorder diagnosis, but rather  
4 schizoaffective. And, again, schizoaffective disorder  
5 is a range. You can say on average a person starts  
6 experiencing these things at 30, or some can start at 20  
7 and some can start at 40. You know, it's a range of  
8 when a person starts to experience those symptoms. In  
9 Mr. Duncan's case, his symptoms don't fit delusional  
10 disorder.

11 Q. So with any of the disorders we have discussed,  
12 including schizoaffective disorder, it's possible, even  
13 with medication, that the delusions could persist?

14 A. You are right, it's possible, but we have to make  
15 sure that we treat Mr. Duncan and see if it's true or  
16 not.

17 Q. Now, you have mentioned that you reviewed the  
18 Charter Peachford medical records?

19 A. I'm sorry, the Peachford medical records?

20 Q. Yes. You reviewed those; is that correct?

21 A. Yes, that's correct.

22 Q. And those records indicate that even after being  
23 treated with an antipsychotic and experiencing some  
24 improvement, Mr. Duncan's delusions still persisted  
25 somewhat?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. That is correct. He improved with intervention to  
2 hypomania, but not improve full blown mania.

3 Q. And you also reviewed the records by Dr. Hege?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. And so you are aware that Dr. Hege noted that even  
6 while Mr. Duncan was on antipsychotics and experienced  
7 some improvement, his delusions still persisted  
8 somewhat?

9 A. When Mr. Duncan was seeing Dr. Hege, there was a  
10 question of his compliance with medication and based on  
11 that, I cannot comment on as to if he was taking the  
12 medication or not and if he was, you know, completely  
13 compliant and still having symptoms.

14 Q. Did you ever personally talk to Dr. Hege about his  
15 treatment of Mr. Duncan?

16 A. No. I reviewed his records.

17 Q. And Dr. Hege treated Mr. Duncan off and on from 2008  
18 until 2011; is that correct?

19 A. That's correct.

20 Q. But you didn't personally talk to him?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Now, you mentioned a couple studies in your report  
23 that you relied on for the effectiveness of the proposed  
24 treatment plan.

25 A. Um-hum.

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. Particularly on page 22 of your report you mentioned  
2 the Herbel and the Cochran study?

3 A. Correct.

4 Q. Focusing first on the Herbel study which dealt with  
5 the treatment of delusion disorder, Herbel did not make  
6 a comparison to an untreated control group, did it?

7 A. Actually, I'm not sure of the specifics of the  
8 study, but if you-- I think Dr. Volin would be better  
9 able to answer this question.

10 Q. Okay. Do you know if the Cochrane 2012 study made a  
11 comparison to an untreated control group?

12 A. I believe the patients were in a control group.  
13 They did not have an untreated control group, no.

14 Q. But you would agree that it's a basic tenant of the  
15 scientific method that failure to compare the results to  
16 an untreated control group can lead to an erroneous leap  
17 in the efficacy of whatever is done?

18 A. The gold standard is a double-blind control study,  
19 but it's not feasible in every case. This study was  
20 done in the Bureau of Prisons, well, that it would be  
21 unethical to not offer medication to one set of  
22 prisoners and not offer it to others. So that study  
23 could not be done. So this study would not be done.

24 Q. But you agree that it is the gold standard in  
25 relying on reports and their efficacy?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. Correct.

2 Q. I would like to move now and talk about some of the  
3 side effects of antipsychotics. Your report discusses a  
4 number of different antipsychotics you believe would  
5 effectively treat Mr. Duncan; is that right?

6 A. That's correct.

7 Q. On a very basic level, and correct me if I am wrong,  
8 antipsychotics tend to block dopamine receptors in the  
9 brain and this can help manage psychosis, including  
10 hallucinations and delusions; is that right?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And psychosis is different from mania; is that  
13 right? Mania is a mood symptom.

14 A. Actually, the dopamine hypothesis also applies to  
15 mania because if you think about it, drugs that increase  
16 dopamine in your brain such as cocaine or whatever, they  
17 have symptoms that are similar to mania. They show  
18 symptoms that are similar to psychosis. So I guess we  
19 believe both mania and psychotic symptoms are similar;  
20 they are related. That's why we are able to use  
21 antipsychotics to treat manic patients.

22 Q. Okay. So you believe that antipsychotics can be  
23 used as a broad brush drug that will treat both mood  
24 symptoms and mania or, I'm sorry, mood symptoms and  
25 psychosis?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. I don't believe it. It's just been proven by  
2 studies that you can treat both mania and psychotic  
3 symptoms with antipsychotics.

4 Q. Okay. But it's possible Mr. Duncan's mood symptoms  
5 could persist with antipsychotics and he may need a mood  
6 stabilizer; is that correct?

7 A. You are right, it's possible.

8 Q. And mood stabilizers do not come in injectable  
9 forms, so they cannot be forced; is that right?

10 A. That's right, but antipsychotics have also been used  
11 as mood stabilizers by themselves and if Mr. Duncan  
12 improves to a point that we can discuss further  
13 medications with him with the help of antipsychotic  
14 medications, we could improve his symptoms further by  
15 adding a mood stabilizer at that point.

16 Q. So Mr. Duncan could later on voluntarily decide to  
17 take mood stabilizers, but you cannot forcibly medicate  
18 with mood stabilizers?

19 A. Not at this time. We cannot use lithium or Depakote  
20 in a form that could be administered forcibly. Again,  
21 antipsychotics such as Risperdal and Haldol, both newer  
22 and older ones have been used as mood stabilizers for  
23 people who have bipolar disorder without adding--

24 Q. And you mentioned-- I'm sorry?

25 A. I'm sorry, without the need for adding a mood

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 stabilizer.

2 Q. You mentioned that you believe Mr. Duncan  
3 experienced some improvement at Peachford Hospital while  
4 he was on an antipsychotic; is that right?

5 A. That is correct.

6 Q. And you are aware that at Peachford Hospital while  
7 he was being given an antipsychotic, he was at the same  
8 time being given a mood stabilizer?

9 A. He was, yes.

10 Q. Okay. So to now move on and discuss some specific  
11 side effects of different medications, I would like to  
12 start with some medications that Mr. Duncan has been  
13 prescribed before and that we have records of in the  
14 past.

15 A. All right.

16 Q. Now, are you aware that Mr. Duncan was prescribed  
17 Seroquel, which is an antipsychotic, for a short period  
18 of time by Dr. Westerman?

19 A. I am not.

20 Q. But you did review the competency evaluation  
21 conducted by Dr. Brauman dated May 8, 2012, did you not?

22 A. I did.

23 Q. Dr. Brauman's report on page 7 indicates that a  
24 Dr. Westerman prescribed Mr. Duncan with Seroquel in  
25 2008.

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. I'm looking on page 7, and it says that-- I'm trying  
2 to find where he mentioned Seroquel on here. I'm sorry,  
3 I'm not seeing that.

4 THE COURT: Where are you located, Counsel?

5 MS. TALLENT: This is page 7 of Dr. Brauman's  
6 competency evaluation, the middle of the second  
7 paragraph.

8 THE WITNESS: Okay. I have located it. Yes,  
9 that's correct. He was treated temporarily with  
10 Seroquel, but continued with untoward side effects.

11 BY MS. TALLENT:

12 Q. Do you know how Dr. Brauman was able to access these  
13 medical records and you were not?

14 A. I do not know.

15 Q. Okay. But you do know that Seroquel is an  
16 antipsychotic?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And like many antipsychotics, it can have numerous  
19 side effects?

20 A. That's correct.

21 Q. It could include side effects such as drowsiness?

22 MS. STERLING: Your Honor, I'm sorry. I'm going  
23 to object at this point. I don't know why we are  
24 discussing Seroquel. It was not part of her report.  
25 It's not something that's she's reviewed. It's contained

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 in a separate report and, quite frankly, it's not a  
2 medication that's recommended in the treatment plan. I  
3 don't see how this is relevant. I don't want to have to  
4 discuss every potential medication on the books.

5 MS. TALLENT: Your Honor, the doctors heavily  
6 rely on Mr. Duncan's past treatment with antipsychotics.  
7 He had side effects on Seroquel, and it's mentioned in  
8 the report.

9 THE COURT: The question becomes though they  
10 relied on it as a part of the projected treatment plan,  
11 did they indicate they were going to use Seroquel?  
12 Though they relied on it in the past, it's irrelevant if  
13 they are not going to use it again, they are not going to  
14 determine if it had those side effects.

15 MS. TALLENT: Your Honor, it's very relevant  
16 because antipsychotics tend to have similar side effects,  
17 and there's a reported note that he experienced side  
18 effects while on Seroquel. They rely on the Peachford  
19 Hospital records with Abilify, and Abilify is not an  
20 injectable.

21 THE COURT: The question for the Court-- it's  
22 not a question. My observation is simply this: They may  
23 have similar side effects, but unless you can establish  
24 that the side effects of Seroquel are the same as the  
25 side effects as the one that they are going to rely on,



S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 then we are wasting time.

2 Now, are you going to put in something that says  
3 that the antipsychotic they plan to use in the treatment  
4 plan has the same side effects as Seroquel?

5 MS. TALLENT: Your Honor, I could ask the doctor  
6 right now.

7 THE COURT: Okay. Well, now, let's do this,  
8 then. Let's find out whether the antipsychotic they  
9 intend to use in their treatment plan-- I'm trying to  
10 remember what the name is?

11 MS. TALLENT: Haldol.

12 THE COURT: Whether that has the same side  
13 effects as Seroquel.

14 MS. TALLENT: Yes, sir.

15 THE COURT: Then the discussion of Seroquel will  
16 become relevant.

17 MS. STERLING: May I make one additional  
18 objection, Your Honor?

19 Looking at this report counsel is making  
20 reference to, all it says is he was given Seroquel and it  
21 was discontinued because of side effects and that  
22 Dr. Brauman reviewed that. There was no--

23 THE COURT: Okay. Well, that's something you  
24 can ask on redirect. Let's just get this point straight,  
25 and then you can ask that on redirect.

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 MS. STERLING: Yes, Your Honor.

2 THE COURT: Let's get this straight. Otherwise,  
3 let's leave Seroquel alone.

4 BY MS. TALLENT:

5 Q. Dr. Patole, Seroquel is an antipsychotic. Would you  
6 agree that it has similar side effects to Haldol, which  
7 is also an antipsychotic?

8 A. So Seroquel is a newer antipsychotic versus Haldol.  
9 Haldol is one of the older antipsychotics. As I  
10 mentioned earlier, the older antipsychotics have  
11 different side effects that we worry about over the  
12 newer ones. The older antipsychotics we worry about the  
13 mood disorders that I mentioned earlier where the newer  
14 antipsychotics we worry more about the metabolic side  
15 effects.

16 Q. Okay. I will move on to the next drug. Your report  
17 mentions that Dr. Hege prescribed Mr. Duncan Abilify; is  
18 that correct?

19 A. That's correct.

20 Q. And Abilify is an antipsychotic?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. It's an antipsychotic that you highly recommend if  
23 Mr. Duncan will take voluntarily; is that right?

24 A. That's correct.

25 Q. And similar to many antipsychotics, Abilify can have

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 side effects?

2 A. Yes, it can.

3 Q. Specifically, Abilify can cause dizziness,  
4 drowsiness, fatigue, sedation?

5 A. Yes. That is one of the slew of side effects  
6 included in the packaging list.

7 Q. As you discussed earlier, it can also cause  
8 neuroleptic malignant syndrome, which you describe as a  
9 life-threatening neurologic disorder?

10 A. That's correct.

11 Q. And another side effect is Tardive Dyskinesia, which  
12 is involuntary muscle movements?

13 A. Actually, Abilify is one of the newer  
14 antipsychotics. It's less likely to cause the Tardive  
15 Dyskinesia than the older antipsychotics like Haldol and  
16 Perphenazine.

17 Q. I understand that it may be less likely than Haldol,  
18 but it's still a potential side effect. Do you agree?

19 A. That's correct.

20 Q. Seizures are another potential side effect that have  
21 been noted with Abilify. Would you agree?

22 A. I'm sorry. Can you repeat the first part of the  
23 question?

24 Q. Another side effect that has been reported for  
25 Abilify are seizures. Would you agree?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. Yes, it's a potential side effect.

2 Q. And in your report you note that Mr. Duncan  
3 complained of side effects when he was on Abilify; is  
4 that correct?

5 A. Yes, that's correct.

6 Q. Specifically, he complained of feeling nonfunctional  
7 and lethargic and complained of sedation; is that  
8 correct?

9 A. So that's correct. It's kind of like a normal speed  
10 limit is 45. But if you are driving 100 miles per hour  
11 and, you know, somebody stops you and says, hey, you  
12 have got to go 45, of course you are going to say I'm  
13 going slower, I am functioning less; I am lethargic. So  
14 compared to his 100 miles per hour, yes, he was slower.  
15 Again, that's the best way I can understand what he was  
16 trying to explain to me.

17 Q. And Mr. Duncan was again prescribed Abilify by  
18 Dr. Volin recently in February of 2013. Are you aware  
19 of that?

20 A. I am not since I was not here.

21 Q. Okay. So you are not aware that he also complained  
22 of feeling sedated and lethargic?

23 A. As I mentioned, I was not here. I left in December  
24 of 2012.

25 Q. And although it's your opinion that these symptoms

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 may just be a result of Mr. Duncan's brain appropriately  
2 reacting to the antipsychotic, you would agree that  
3 feeling sedated and lethargic and nonfunctional, those  
4 are all reported side effects of these antipsychotics?

5 A. Again, sedation is a potential side effect, but  
6 again, we will monitor him for it and also you will dose  
7 it appropriately. Also, the longer he's on the  
8 medication, the less the sedation will be something that  
9 will interfere with his functioning.

10 Q. Okay. So Mr. Duncan was also prescribed Risperdal  
11 at FMC Butner in June of 2012; is that right?

12 A. That's correct. Starting in July.

13 Q. I'm sorry, July. And Risperdal is also an  
14 antipsychotic; is that correct?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And side effects of Risperdal can also include  
17 sedation, fatigue, dizziness?

18 A. That's correct.

19 Q. And it can include neuroleptic malignant syndrome,  
20 that life-threatening neurological disorder?

21 A. Yes, that's possible.

22 Q. And Tardive Dyskinesia is also possible?

23 A. Again, Risperdal is one of the newer medications, so  
24 it's less likely, but, yes, it's possible.

25 Q. Seizures are also possible?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. Yeah, that is slightly.

2 Q. Now, you mentioned earlier you were aware that  
3 Mr. Duncan was prescribed Risperdal in July of 2012.  
4 Are you also aware that he stops taking those  
5 medications shortly thereafter and complained of side  
6 effects?

7 A. Again, I'm not sure exactly-- we can't be sure the  
8 medication caused the side effects-- that Risperdal  
9 caused side effects because, again, we found medications  
10 in his cell that he had not taken. So I don't know, I  
11 cannot put 2 and 2 together.

12 Q. Your report notes that he was prescribed the  
13 medication on July 27, and then it was on August 2nd,  
14 2012 that he stopped taking it and you found two pills  
15 in his room; is that right?

16 A. That's correct. That's what the report says.

17 Q. So from July 27th to August 2nd, even taking away  
18 two pills he potentially took at least five doses of  
19 Abilify-- or Risperdal, I'm sorry?

20 A. Again, this is based on a pattern Mr. Duncan has of  
21 noncompliance. So it is possible that he took the five  
22 doses and was experiencing side effects, but I can't say  
23 for sure.

24 Q. And do you know what the specific side effects he  
25 complained of consisted of?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. Mr. Duncan basically complained about feeling slowed  
2 down, I believe.

3 Q. I do not believe the report ever mentions any  
4 specific complaints of side effects. Was a record made  
5 of those complaints?

6 A. Yes, I think so. It should be in the Bureau of  
7 Prisons records in the medical records.

8 Q. But you didn't describe his experience or complaints  
9 in your report?

10 A. I did not, no.

11 Q. Now, in addition to Mr. Duncan's own complaints of  
12 side effects, your report notes that his side effects  
13 have also been observed by others. Specifically on page  
14 6 of your report, you note that his wife mentions he was  
15 often zombie-like on antipsychotics?

16 A. Yes. I recall that being documented, yes.

17 Q. I would like to now move to some of the  
18 antipsychotics you recommend. First I would like to  
19 talk about Haldol. That's your No. 1 recommended  
20 antipsychotic; is that right?

21 A. If Mr. Duncan does not take medications voluntary,  
22 that would be the No. 1 recommended injectable  
23 medication, yes.

24 Q. And in your report on page 29 you note that it will  
25 likely be ineffective for the Court to threaten a

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 contempt order in order to get Mr. Duncan to take the  
2 medication voluntarily. So in your opinion it's  
3 unlikely he's going to take his medication voluntarily?

4 A. It is unlikely, but again, if we have the support of  
5 the Court, that could give Mr. Duncan a different  
6 perspective on things and he might be more cooperative  
7 to his treatment.

8 Q. But on page 29 of your report you say that a  
9 contempt order from the Court is not effective in  
10 persuading defendants to take medication; is that  
11 correct?

12 A. Again, how Mr. Duncan is going to react to the Court  
13 order I cannot say, but I'm putting a positive spin on  
14 things that I'm hoping that we can work with Mr. Duncan  
15 on a voluntary basis.

16 Q. Okay. Well, given that Haldol is your No. 1  
17 injectable medication, it's an antipsychotic that would  
18 have side effects; is that correct?

19 A. Yes, it does.

20 Q. Specifically on Haldol, one can experience lethargy,  
21 heart arrhythmia, drowsiness or sedation; is that  
22 correct?

23 A. Again, these are all known side effects of Haldol,  
24 and we are going to be monitoring Mr. Duncan closely in  
25 the hospital setting for these side effects.



S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. And you can also experience neuroleptic malignant  
2 syndrome, a life-threatening neurologic disorder?

3 A. Yes. And again, it's possible. But again, we are  
4 going to be monitoring him closely in a hospitalized  
5 setting.

6 Q. And the risk of Tardive Dyskinesia is higher with  
7 Haldol than with many other antipsychotics; is that  
8 right?

9 A. That is correct. But again, the risk increases  
10 after more than six months of therapy with Haldol. If  
11 Mr. Duncan is able to maintain well, we can even talk  
12 about switching him to another less antipsychotic  
13 medication that is less likely to do so long term, but  
14 immediately we need to stabilize him where we can have  
15 that discussion with him.

16 Q. Another side effect that has been reported with  
17 Haldol is sudden death; is that correct?

18 A. That is correct, in folks who have dementia.  
19 There's a black box warning regarding this that folks  
20 who have-- elderly folks who have dementia have a higher  
21 risk of sudden death with antipsychotic medications.

22 Q. You just mentioned earlier that this risk with  
23 Haldol, especially for Tardive Dyskinesia, only  
24 increases in the long term; is that correct?

25 A. Yes. The longer you are on the medication, the

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 higher the risk.

2 Q. And your report also mentions Cogentin may be also  
3 given in conjunction with Haldol to combat some of these  
4 muscular side effects; is that correct?

5 A. Yes. Cogentin can be given to combat any symptom  
6 that the patient may be experiencing with Haldol.

7 Q. And Cogentin is a medication that could have side  
8 effects; is that correct?

9 A. That is correct.

10 Q. But your report does not discuss any side effects  
11 associated with Cogentin; is that correct?

12 A. It does not.

13 Q. Specifically, studies have shown that Cogentin can  
14 increase the risk of Tardive Dyskinesia. Are you aware  
15 of that?

16 A. I am not.

17 Q. I would like to move to the next antipsychotic you  
18 recommend, and that's Prolixin.

19 Q. Okay. Prolixin, I guess, is a common name for  
20 Fluphenazine; is that correct?

21 A. That's correct.

22 Q. And Prolixin is an antipsychotic that can have side  
23 effects?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. It can cause neuroleptic malignant syndrome and

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 Tardive Dyskinesia?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And it can also cause mental and physical  
4 disabilities and cause liver damage potentially?

5 A. It's possible.

6 Q. And the third antipsychotic you list is Risperdal;  
7 is that correct?

8 A. That's correct.

9 Q. And we've already discussed the side effects of  
10 Risperdal and Duncan's past complaints of side effects  
11 on that medication; is that correct?

12 A. That's correct.

13 Q. And with all of these side effects, in addition to  
14 the serious ones I have pointed out, it can also cause  
15 metabolic side effects such as weight gain, diabetes,  
16 elevated serum lipids; is that correct?

17 A. That's correct. Again, these are all of the side  
18 effects that we would be watching Mr. Duncan closely  
19 for.

20 Q. And we have discussed Tardive Dyskinesia, which is a  
21 painful involuntary muscle spasm.

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. Tardive Dyskinesia can be irreversible even after  
24 discontinuing the medication; is that correct?

25 A. It is possible, yes.

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. And, again, this risk of Tardive Dyskinesia, this  
2 irreversible risk only increases with time; is that  
3 correct?

4 A. That is correct.

5 Q. Ultimately we have discussed multiple medications at  
6 this point and numerous side effects, and part of the  
7 reason we have discussed so many is that you cannot say  
8 definitively which specific medications will actually be  
9 administered to Mr. Duncan; is that correct?

10 A. That's correct. Again, this is all based on what  
11 options we will have available when we are allowed to  
12 treat Mr. Duncan. Every medication has a side effect,  
13 but again, you always weigh the risk against the  
14 benefit. The benefit is that he will be able to go on  
15 with his legal issues and be able to resolve them,  
16 whereas just kind of languish here in this limbo state.

17 Q. So it's possible Mr. Duncan could be given a  
18 medication that's not listed in the report; is that  
19 correct?

20 A. We have proposed this plan and, yes, we are going to  
21 be trying to adhere to this plan. That's the reason we  
22 proposed it.

23 Q. But again, as you mentioned earlier, you can't  
24 guarantee that any of these medications will be the  
25 actual medications that are administered?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. I mean, as a physician I cannot guarantee anything.  
2 It would be wrong of me to say so.

3 Q. And this is especially true given you will not be  
4 involved in the treatment of Mr. Duncan?

5 A. That's correct, I will not be involved in  
6 Mr. Duncan's treatment as I will have graduated.

7 Q. I would like to just briefly go back and discuss the  
8 long term versus short term side effects we mentioned  
9 earlier. Your report mentions, and you have said today,  
10 that Tardive Dyskinesia is much less likely to emerge  
11 over the short term; is that correct?

12 A. That's correct, only after about six months of  
13 therapy.

14 Q. Okay. So by short term, you think six months or  
15 less or likely the four-month period he will be treated?

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. So in evaluating his side effects, you took into  
18 consideration this short-term period you thought he  
19 would be forcibly medicated for?

20 A. I think that's correct, I think. Again, clarify  
21 your question, please? I had a hard time hearing the  
22 last part.

23 Q. Yes. When you evaluated the side effects of the  
24 antipsychotics that you recommend, you took into account  
25 the short term four-month period that you believe he

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 will be medicated for?

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. But ultimately, no matter what the time frame, it's  
4 possible that any of these side effects could appear in  
5 the short term?

6 A. It's always possible.

7 THE COURT: Let's put it this way: I have  
8 listened to the questions about what is possible. The  
9 Court always understands it really calls for  
10 speculation. Anything is possible when you start talking  
11 about medication. So I hear the questions and I hear the  
12 answers, but I understand it's pure speculation about  
13 what might happen with all of these drugs.

14 You can continue.

15 BY MS. TALLENT:

16 Q. To move on from some of the side effects-- before we  
17 completely move on, I would like to discuss monitoring  
18 these side effects. You have mentioned that you will  
19 closely monitor for the emergence of any of these side  
20 effects; is that right?

21 A. That's correct.

22 Q. Because it's very important, especially with things  
23 like Tardive Dyskinesia that can be permanent and  
24 debilitating, that you catch these signs early; is that  
25 right?

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 A. That's correct.

2 Q. But on page 25 of your report you note that the  
3 treating psychiatrist will only check for delayed onset  
4 mood disorders on a monthly basis.

5 A. That's correct.

6 Q. And even assuming that you can effectively monitor  
7 him at FMC Butner, there's going to be a period of time  
8 where if he's rendered competent, he will leave FMC  
9 Butner for his trial; is that correct?

10 A. I think you are asking me to speculate about the  
11 future, which I have no power to do, about where he will  
12 go and what type of treatment he will receive.

13 Q. So you cannot guarantee that his side effects will  
14 be monitored once he leaves FMC Butner?

15 A. Like I said, I can't guarantee anything.

16 Q. And do you know if any of these local prisons will  
17 even administer these antipsychotics?

18 MS. STERLING: Objection, Your Honor. Clearly  
19 she has no basis of knowledge for that.

20 THE COURT: Sustained. She has indicated she is  
21 leaving training and she can't speculate about what they  
22 are going to do after she leaves.

23 MS. TALLENT: Yes, sir, Your Honor.

24 BY MS. TALLENT:

25 Q. Now, moving on, not only have you opined that your

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 treatment plan will be substantially likely to render  
2 Mr. Duncan competent, but you have also opined that none  
3 of these side effects will interfere with his ability to  
4 assist counsel; is that correct?

5 A. That is correct. We are going to be monitoring him  
6 periodically and closely to make sure that he is  
7 receiving the best possible side-effect profile,  
8 basically, that they are minimizing all these side  
9 effects.

10 Q. Presumably you have never sat at counsel table in a  
11 criminal trial, have you?

12 MS. STERLING: Objection, Your Honor.

13 THE COURT: I will see where we are going with  
14 this question. I think-- let's see where we are going  
15 with this question.

16 BY MS. TALLENT:

17 Q. I'm sorry, I didn't hear your answer.

18 A. Can you please repeat your question?

19 Q. You have never sat at counsel table in a criminal  
20 trial, have you?

21 A. No, as a doctor, I have not.

22 Q. So you have not experienced what it really is for a  
23 defendant to assist in his defense?

24 A. I have not.

25 Q. So you would agree that a defendant may have to sit



S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 relatively still for long periods of time?

2 MS. STERLING: Objection again, Your Honor.

3 This witness has no basis of knowledge for answering  
4 these questions.

5 THE COURT: Well, the Court will permit her to  
6 rephrase the question as a hypothetical in terms of  
7 whether-- as a hypothetical, since she has never sat at  
8 counsel table, to get at what potential side effects may  
9 come into play.

10 MS. TALLENT: Yes, Your Honor.

11 BY MS. TALLENT:

12 Q. So you would agree that, hypothetically, in a  
13 criminal trial a defendant may have to sit for long  
14 periods of time?

15 A. That's correct.

16 THE COURT: Well, that's the wrong form, but she  
17 said correct.

18 BY MS. TALLENT:

19 Q. And, hypothetically, he will have to respond quickly  
20 to questions from his counsel?

21 MS. STERLING: Your Honor, again, the government  
22 objects.

23 THE COURT: Well, I sustain the objection  
24 because of the form of the question. I told you that you  
25 could put it in the form of a hypothetical, the

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 hypothetical being if A, B, C, D, E and F, then what is  
2 the potential impact of certain antipsychotic drugs? If  
3 you are sitting long, if you have to confer with counsel,  
4 if then what impact potentially would the antipsychotic  
5 drugs have?

6 BY MS. TALLENT:

7 Q. I will just reiterate, and then I will move on, that  
8 you opined that these side effects are not likely to  
9 interfere with his ability to assist counsel, but you  
10 have never experienced or sat at counsel table at a  
11 criminal trial; is that correct?

12 A. I have no experience with criminal proceedings, no.

13 Q. Okay. I will move on to discuss alternative less  
14 intrusive treatments. You didn't consider less  
15 intrusive treatments to forced medication, did you?

16 A. There are no alternative medications-- alternative  
17 treatment to medications at this point for Mr. Duncan.

18 Q. Your report states that cognitive behavioral therapy  
19 could be considered in conjunction with antipsychotics;  
20 is that correct?

21 A. Again, the key word is in conjunction, not by  
22 itself.

23 Q. Right. Have you ever attempted cognitive behavioral  
24 therapy without also treating with antipsychotics?

25 A. No.

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. And you are not willing to consider less common  
2 alternatives such as dark therapy?

3 A. I am not-- there is no such thing as dark therapy.  
4 I know it's a theoretical treatment model, but it's not  
5 something I would treat my patients with.

6 Q. Although you may not agree with it, you would agree  
7 that there are studies showing that dark therapy can be  
8 a treatment for mania?

9 A. Actually, I am just aware of one paper that I  
10 glanced at, so I am not familiar with the literature,  
11 no.

12 Q. But dark therapy simply consists of induced  
13 darkness; is that correct?

14 A. I think basically dark therapy is putting somebody  
15 in isolation, which Mr. Duncan was in isolation when he  
16 was in New York, but it was not effective.

17 Q. Have you ever attempted any alternative treatments  
18 besides medication?

19 A. No, I have not, not for somebody who is largely  
20 psychotic.

21 Q. Mr. Duncan is very willing to participate in  
22 alternative treatments, isn't he?

23 A. I would commend Mr. Duncan for that, but at this  
24 time in my medical judgment he requires medication and  
25 not any alternative therapy.

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. But you would agree he's willing to a participate in  
2 alternative treatments?

3 A. I am not willing.

4 Q. To touch briefly on Mr. Duncan's fundamental rights,  
5 you would agree that it's a tenant of your medical  
6 license which was issued by the North Carolina medical  
7 board that there be a respect for patient autonomy?

8 A. I'm sorry, can you repeat the last part?

9 Q. Sure. One of the tenants of your medical license  
10 which was issued by the North Carolina medical board is  
11 a respect for patient autonomy?

12 A. And in order for me-- I think-- I respect my  
13 patients, but at this time Mr. Duncan lacks the insight  
14 and the judgment in his illness that does not allow him  
15 to make medical decisions for himself. He does not have  
16 the insight or judgment. As a physician, it's part of  
17 my job in treating my patients to recommend the best  
18 therapy possible.

19 Q. Have you witnessed the forced medication procedure  
20 when a defendant is uncooperative?

21 A. I have not since I have been here, no.

22 Q. Do you know what the procedure is?

23 MS. STERLING: Objection to the relevance again,  
24 Your Honor. She says she has never witnessed it. There  
25 is no suggestion there's any forced medication treatment

S. Patole, M.D. - Cross

1 protocol in the treatment plan.

2 THE COURT: Well, the Court sustains the  
3 objection. She says she has not witnessed it. You asked  
4 does she know what it is? I don't know that these  
5 questions and answers are going to help the Court decide  
6 the four *Sell* factors.

7 BY MS. TALLENT:

8 Q. On page 34 of your report you mentioned that  
9 standard procedures will be used to forcibly medicate  
10 the defendant if he becomes uncooperative?

11 A. That is correct.

12 Q. So my question is, are you aware of what those  
13 procedures are?

14 A. I don't know the specifics of them, no.

15 Q. Okay. Just to end, you are no longer at FMC Butner;  
16 is that correct?

17 A. That's correct.

18 Q. And so you will not be administering or treating  
19 Mr. Duncan?

20 A. I will not.

21 Q. And so because you are gone and you have no control  
22 over his treatment, you can't say with certainty that  
23 the medications discussed in the report will be the  
24 medications actually administered?

25 A. You are correct, I cannot speculate about what's

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 going to happen.

2 MS. TALLENT: Okay. Thank you, Dr. Patole.

3 Those are all the questions I have.

4 THE COURT: Any redirect?

5 MS. STERLING: I will be brief, Your Honor.

6 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

7 BY MS. STERLING:

8 Q. Dr. Patole, defense counsel asked you about the  
9 number of diagnoses Mr. Duncan has had in the past.  
10 With regard to Dr. Hege's diagnosis, you indicated, and  
11 this is in the report, it was rule out bipolar. What  
12 does "rule out" mean?

13 A. So "rule out" diagnosis is a working diagnosis.  
14 It's a diagnosis in progress. It's not the ultimate  
15 diagnosis, but it's an assumed diagnosis. You don't  
16 have a complete picture, and that's why we used the word  
17 "rule out".

18 Q. Okay. So he's thinking it could be. It's possibly  
19 bipolar. That wasn't an actual diagnosis?

20 A. That's correct, it's a possible diagnosis.

21 Q. Okay. And the Peachford diagnosis was bipolar  
22 manic; is that correct?

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. Okay. Dr. Brauman's diagnosis was bipolar, severe  
25 with psychotic features, correct?

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 A. That's correct.

2 Q. Just briefly, if you could, tell us what is  
3 different between your diagnosis and the diagnosis of  
4 the Peachford doctors and Dr. Brauman?

5 A. I'm going to go back to the analogy of a movie.  
6 Both at Peachford and Dr. Brauman saw Mr. Duncan at  
7 certain points of time, but we have the advantage of  
8 reviewing their record and collecting information from  
9 everybody else. Rather than just seeing him on these  
10 instances, we have seen the entire-- we have kind of  
11 reviewed the history to know what type of symptoms he  
12 was having.

13 So based on that, you know, he was having  
14 psychotic symptoms when he was less manic. He was  
15 having-- you know, when he was manic, he had periods of  
16 true mania, that he was not sleeping, he was very  
17 hypervocal, and so forth. So based on that, we  
18 diagnosed him as schizoaffective disorder.

19 Q. Okay. Correct me if I am wrong. Bipolar disorder  
20 is characterized by mania; is that correct?

21 A. Yes, that's correct. In order for him to meet  
22 criteria for bipolar disorder, he must have had  
23 experienced a manic episode.

24 Q. Do you necessarily have psychotic features with  
25 bipolar?

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 A. It's not necessary for-- that's correct, it's not  
2 required for the episode to have psychotic features.

3 Q. And the term "psychotic features", what does that  
4 mean?

5 A. Sure. Psychotic features or psychotic symptoms are  
6 what we call delusions, hallucinations. You know,  
7 deluded like a fake belief, and hallucinations are  
8 auditory, visual hallucinations, meaning you hear things  
9 no one else can hear and you see things no one else can  
10 see. So those can be psychotic features.

11 Q. And psychotic features are characteristic or  
12 symptomatic of schizophrenia; is that correct?

13 A. I'm sorry. Could you repeat the question, please?

14 Q. Psychotic features are characteristic or symptomatic  
15 of schizophrenia; is that correct?

16 A. Yes. Delusions and hallucinations can be symptoms  
17 of schizophrenia.

18 Q. So Dr. Brauman's evaluation of bipolar severe with  
19 psychotic features, that diagnosis acknowledges an  
20 observation of mania and delusion or psychotic features  
21 in the patient, Mr. Duncan; is that correct?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. And these were the same features that you observed  
24 that led you to your diagnosis; is that correct?

25 A. That is correct. Again, it was an episodic period



S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 where he was manic and psychotic at the same time, but  
2 when we saw him here at FMC, he was mainly psychotic.

3 Q. All right. Now, counsel asked you quite a bit about  
4 delusional disorder. Is delusional disorder a  
5 recognized diagnosis?

6 A. It is a recognized diagnosis. It's a nonbazaar  
7 fixed belief that-- or nonbazaar delusion that is  
8 interfering with somebody's life.

9 Q. What do you mean by nonbazaar delusion?

10 A. Nonbazaar is something that's possible to occur. An  
11 example would be a student who thinks that their  
12 teachers may be grading them unfairly, and that's the  
13 only belief that they subscribe to and you can't talk  
14 them out of it.

15 Q. And so how is delusional disorder different from  
16 schizoaffective disorder bipolar type II that you have  
17 diagnosed?

18 A. So again, delusional disorder, that's the only  
19 symptom you have. You just have this held belief. You  
20 don't have any root symptoms.

21 Q. No mania?

22 A. No mania, no depression. You just have the  
23 delusional belief.

24 Q. Okay. And based on your evaluation that would  
25 include your observations and discussions with

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 Mr. Duncan, as well as your review of his records, can  
2 you see any basis for diagnosing him with delusional  
3 disorder as opposed to schizoaffective or bipolar severe  
4 with psychotic features?

5 A. No. Based on our evaluation, he meets criteria for  
6 schizoaffective disorder and bipolar type II.

7 Q. Would it be fair to say that you ruled out  
8 delusional disorder?

9 A. Yes, it was ruled out.

10 Q. Thank you. When we are talking about whether  
11 delusion is bazaar or nonbazaar, what exactly is the  
12 nature of Mr. Duncan's delusion?

13 A. Mr. Duncan had both bazaar and nonbazaar delusions.  
14 He believed that Mr. Rose swindled him out of some  
15 money, which we know is correct, but again he carried it  
16 to the next degree, believing that Mr. Rose is after him  
17 for monitoring him; he was monitoring his router  
18 activity and so forth. He also had bazaar delusions  
19 such as I'm able to control things with my mind.

20 Q. Right.

21 A. But he has a combination of both.

22 Q. Okay. And as far as his delusion involving  
23 Mr. Rose, he had also involved a Ms. Bashama; is that  
24 correct.

25 A. That's correct.

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 Q. Who does his delusion extend to beyond those two  
2 persons?

3 A. I'm sorry. Say again?

4 Q. Who is included in that delusion beyond those two  
5 persons? Does his delusion apply to persons outside of  
6 those two individuals?

7 A. Yeah. So initially Mr. Duncan's delusions were only  
8 encompassing Mr. Rose and Ms. Bashama. When he came  
9 here, the more resistant he got to the staff in terms of  
10 his delusions, he included more and more folks into that  
11 delusion, including Dr. Volin as being involved in a  
12 conspiracy with Mr. Rose against him.

13 Q. All right. And did it also include government  
14 agencies and other persons involved in these  
15 proceedings?

16 A. Yes. It involves the FBI, the IRS and the  
17 military. The scope of these delusions has continued to  
18 expand.

19 Q. Okay. You made reference to interviews with family  
20 members, including his ex-wife and son. Are there  
21 indications that he had a delusion that he had mind  
22 control? Doesn't your report also indicate on page 7  
23 that he has a delusion that he is the grandson of Albert  
24 Einstein?

25 A. That is correct. That's one of his delusions that

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 while his grandmother-- Albert Einstein was at the place  
2 where his mother was staying, and he's related to Albert  
3 Einstein.

4 Q. Would you characterize that as bazaar or nonbazaar  
5 delusion?

6 A. I would definitely characterize that as a bazaar  
7 delusion.

8 Q. All right. Moving on to the medications, you were  
9 asked about the different medications and, specifically,  
10 about mood stabilizers. Just to be clear, these  
11 medications, the antipsychotics, they have mood  
12 stabilizing attributes; is that correct?

13 A. That is correct. Antipsychotic medications are used  
14 as mood stabilizers in folks with bipolar disorder or  
15 schizoaffective disorder.

16 Q. Okay. It is, of course, the case and you would  
17 agree that all medications have side effects; is that  
18 correct?

19 A. I'm sorry?

20 Q. That all medications have side effects?

21 A. That is correct.

22 Q. And the reported treatment plan, they outlined every  
23 instance where side effects are discussed, the  
24 likelihood, the possibility, as well as a plan to  
25 monitor and treat side effects; is that correct?

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 A. That's correct.

2 Q. And as far as these severe side effects, the  
3 neuroleptic malignant syndrome and sudden death  
4 syndrome, the report does outline that these are very,  
5 very unlikely to occur; is that correct?

6 A. These are extremely rare side effects.

7 Q. But, as in all medications, you as a physician are  
8 setting forth all of the possible side effects for the  
9 purposes of disclosure and letting the Court know that  
10 you are aware of these and plan to deal with them; is  
11 that correct?

12 A. That's correct.

13 Q. Also, the--

14 THE COURT: You are doing a fine job of leading  
15 there, Counsel.

16 MS. STERLING: I'm sorry, Your Honor. I've got  
17 to wind this up.

18 THE COURT: Yes, ma'am.

19 BY MS. STERLING:

20 Q. As far as alternative treatments, you indicated in  
21 response to the question that cognitive behavior theory  
22 would not be effective alone with Mr. Duncan. Why is  
23 that?

24 A. Cognitive behavior therapy is for a patient who has  
25 psychotic delusions and would involve somebody willing

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 to work with a therapist in acknowledging that their  
2 beliefs might be true. That's pretty hard to do with  
3 Mr. Duncan. It's unlikely that any therapist would be  
4 able to work with him on that delusional belief. That's  
5 why cognitive behavior therapy is always used in  
6 conjunction with medication, because it gives us that  
7 little wiggle room to have the patient work on their  
8 delusional beliefs and work through them.

9 MS. STERLING: Okay. Thank you, Dr. Patole.

10 THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen, I think this  
11 is the time to take a break. We are going to take about  
12 a 15-minute break and when we come back, we are going to  
13 the next witness.

14 (A recess was taken at 12:04 p.m., after which  
15 court reconvened at 12:25 p.m.)

16 THE COURT: Counsel, may Dr. Patole be excused  
17 permanently?

18 MS. STERLING: No objection from the government,  
19 Your Honor. Thank you.

20 MS. TALLENT: No objection.

21 THE COURT: All right. Doctor, you may be  
22 excused permanently. Thank you very much.

23 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

24 (Witness excused.)

25 THE COURT: We still have two witnesses here.

S. Patole, M.D. - Redirect

1 MS. STERLING: The government would like to call  
2 next Dr. Jill Volin. I'm not sure that we are going to  
3 need the third witness. I would ask him to remain.

4 THE COURT: Well, what I prefer to do during the  
5 course of the testimony is just have one there at the  
6 table, whoever is testifying. They can remain, but I  
7 just want one there at the table.

8 MS. STERLING: Perhaps we don't need Mr. Marra.  
9 Quite frankly, Your Honor, Mr. Marra was here today in  
10 case there was some question that arose. He is currently  
11 treating Mr. Duncan at the facility. The government had  
12 no questions, but thought the Court might have questions  
13 and wanted him to be available for that purpose.

14 THE COURT: Okay. If he would just step out of  
15 the frame of the camera, he can just wait in case we need  
16 him.

17 Okay. That way we are looking at one person.

18 MS. STERLING: Yes, sir.

19 (The witness was sworn by the deputy clerk.)

20 THE COURT: Before we get started, approximately  
21 how long do you think this direct examination will  
22 probably take?

23 MS. STERLING: Perhaps 45 minutes. No more than  
24 that. I'm going to try to shorten it up so we don't have  
25 too much repetition.

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 THE COURT: The Court has a jury that's waiting,  
2 and I'm trying to make sure I don't conflict with that  
3 schedule. So I think what we may have to do to avoid  
4 conflicting with that schedule, I will have you get to  
5 the end of your-- well, let's move on. We may be here  
6 until 2:00, but we are still going to take a break. We  
7 will try to get through this witness without a break.

8 MS. STERLING: All right. Thank you very much,  
9 Your Honor.

10 THE COURT: All right. You can proceed.

11 JILL C. VOLIN, M.D., called as a witness, having  
12 been first duly sworn, was examined and testified as  
13 follows:

14 DIRECT EXAMINATION

15 BY MS. STERLING:

16 Q. If you would, please state your full name for the  
17 Court.

18 A. Dr. Jill C. Volin, V-o-l-i-n.

19 Q. And how are you employed, Dr. Volin?

20 A. I'm a staff forensic psychiatrist at FMC Butner,  
21 North Carolina.

22 Q. And how long have you been a staff psychiatrist at  
23 Butner?

24 A. Since March of 2012.

25 Q. And you are licensed to practice medicine; is that



J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 correct?

2 A. Yes. I have had a full unrestricted license to  
3 practice medicine since 2006.

4 Q. And are you board certified in forensic psychiatry?

5 A. Yes. I am double boarded both in psychiatry and  
6 forensic psychiatry.

7 Q. Okay. And have you ever testified in court before  
8 as an expert in forensic psychiatry?

9 A. Yes. I have been qualified as an expert 12 times in  
10 forensic psychiatry and three times in psychiatry.

11 Q. Thank you, Dr. Volin.

12 MS. STERLING: Your Honor, we would offer  
13 Government's Exhibit No. 9, which is Dr. Volin's CV,  
14 which has been stipulated to. I would ask she be found  
15 to be an expert in forensic psychiatry.

16 MS. HARRIS: No objection, Your Honor.

17 THE COURT: All right. Thank you. The document  
18 will be admitted.

19 (Government's Exhibit No. 9 was admitted.)

20 BY MS. STERLING:

21 Q. In the course of your employment as a forensic  
22 psychiatrist at Butner, have you come in contact with  
23 Keith Duncan?

24 A. Yes. Mr. Duncan was admitted to our facility July  
25 19th, 2012 for an evaluation of his competency to stand

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 trial and restoration. He was discharged January 8th,  
2 2013, re-admitted February 28th and discharged April  
3 30th.

4 Q. Are you able to see Mr. Duncan here today? Is that  
5 within your range of view?

6 A. Yes, I can see Mr. Duncan now.

7 Q. And if the record could reflect that the witness  
8 identified the defendant, Your Honor.

9 THE COURT: The record will so reflect.

10 BY MS. STERLING:

11 Q. And what did your evaluation of Mr. Duncan consist  
12 of, if you would just describe it briefly?

13 A. Well, over the course of the last ten months the  
14 evaluation consisted of clinical interviews with  
15 Mr. Duncan, with myself, with Dr. Patole and with  
16 Dr. Marra. It also consisted of routine physical  
17 examination and laboratory studies, an MRI of his  
18 brain. We also reviewed collateral information provided  
19 by the defense and the government and his family, and  
20 the observation of our staff members, our nurses and our  
21 correctional officers were also incorporated into the  
22 report.

23 Q. Okay. And did you personally meet with Mr. Duncan  
24 during this period of evaluation?

25 A. Yes, I did.

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 Q. And about how many times?

2 A. I met with him multiple times a week during August  
3 of 2012 and July of 2012.

4 After the report was submitted in August, I met  
5 with him less often, probably once or twice a week. And  
6 then when he returned to us again in February, I met  
7 with him multiple times a week at the beginning and then  
8 weekly as we were waiting for the Court to reschedule  
9 this hearing.

10 Q. And about how long were your meetings?

11 A. In the beginning the meetings would last a long  
12 time, an hour or more. As the course of the evaluation  
13 continued and we were waiting for the Court to answer  
14 the question of involuntary medication, the meetings  
15 were much shorter. Mr. Duncan was unwilling to take  
16 medication and his presentation had not changed.  
17 Multiple meetings resulted in him becoming more  
18 agitated, which is the reason why those meetings were  
19 cut short and held less often.

20 Q. Has he changed significantly in all of these  
21 meetings from the time that you first met him until the  
22 time of your last meeting?

23 A. I would say the content of his psychotic delusions  
24 has remained the same. However, there has been some  
25 variation in levels of mania. There have been times

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 when he has had a very pressured speech, has had  
2 insomnia and very difficult to redirect as a result of  
3 his mania, and especially his last admission when that  
4 was not as prominent. So that's how I would briefly  
5 describe the change in his mental status.

6 Q. And in addition to your own meetings and evaluations  
7 with Mr. Duncan, did you supervise the work of  
8 Dr. Patole in her examinations and evaluations?

9 A. Yes, I did. I sat in on a small number of her  
10 interviews with him and the interviews I did not sit in  
11 on, I discussed them with her. I also edited the  
12 portions of the report that she wrote.

13 Q. And you, in fact, prepared two reports with  
14 Dr. Patole; is that correct?

15 A. That is correct.

16 Q. And there was one in September and one in December;  
17 is that correct?

18 A. Yes. I believe the date of the first report was  
19 August 7, 2012, and the second December 12th.

20 Q. And based on your evaluation with Dr. Patole, based  
21 on what you received and did with her as well as your  
22 own observations and assessments of Mr. Duncan, did you  
23 formulate an opinion as to whether Mr. Duncan was  
24 suffering from a mental disease or defect?

25 A. Yes. It is my opinion that he suffers from a severe

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 psychotic illness called schizoaffective disorder.

2 Q. Is that the same diagnosis that Dr. Patole arrived  
3 at?

4 A. I was not present for her testimony, but yes, that's  
5 the diagnosis we arrived at together, and we put it in  
6 our report.

7 Q. That is the diagnosis that was in the report; is  
8 that correct?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Okay. What caused you to reach this diagnosis?

11 A. Schizoaffective disorder is diagnosed when someone  
12 meets criteria for criterion A schizophrenia while also  
13 having evidence of previous manic mix or depressive  
14 episodes.

15 We diagnosed Mr. Duncan with schizoaffective  
16 disorder bipolar type because over the course of his  
17 illness he has had manic and hypomanic episodes, and the  
18 reason why we diagnosed him schizoaffective disorder  
19 over bipolar disorder is there have been periods in his  
20 history and I have also personally witnessed times in  
21 which the psychosis, the delusions, continued while the  
22 mania is much less prominent.

23 Q. Okay. And are you aware of diagnoses made by other  
24 treating psychiatrists or health professionals with  
25 regard to Mr. Duncan?

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 A. Yes. Most of his previous treating professionals,  
2 either on an outpatient basis or an inpatient basis,  
3 diagnosed bipolar disorder. Some people diagnosed  
4 bipolar disorder with psychotic features. In addition,  
5 Dr. Brauman IMPT North also diagnosed bipolar disorder  
6 with psychotic features.

7 Q. How did you come up with the diagnosis that you made  
8 of Mr. Duncan?

9 A. Well, there are significant overlaps between these  
10 two diagnoses, schizoaffective disorder bipolar type and  
11 bipolar disorder with psychotic features.

12 You diagnose bipolar disorder with psychotic  
13 features when the psychosis occurs only when the patient  
14 is experiencing a severe episode, only when they are in  
15 an event with symptoms of depression or in the midst of  
16 manic depression; a schizoaffective disorder of bipolar  
17 type when the psychotic symptoms or, in Mr. Duncan's  
18 case, the delusions continue when he is not in a  
19 prominent mood episode.

20 Q. Okay. And you did review the findings of other  
21 psychiatrists and treating physicians in reaching your  
22 evaluation and diagnosis; is that correct?

23 A. Yes. The mental health diagnoses is important to  
24 look at person's history and how that person and their  
25 illness progresses over time. At the time he was

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 diagnosed with bipolar disorder with psychotic features  
2 in Atlanta he was in the midst of a manic episode.

3           Also when he was in New York with Dr. Brauman,  
4 he was in the midst of a manic episode. One of the  
5 advantages of having a four-month or, in this case, an  
6 almost nine-month evaluation is that I get the  
7 opportunity to review an extensive amount of collateral,  
8 interview family and to make these observations myself.

9           If I had the same information that was presented  
10 to me as Dr. Brauman did or the treating psychiatrist, I  
11 may have arrived at the same conclusion, bipolar  
12 disorder with psychotic features; but because I assessed  
13 more information and more observational data, I think  
14 that a diagnosis of schizoaffective disorder is more  
15 accurate.

16 Q. Okay. But it is not entirely contrary or  
17 inconsistent with bipolar disorder with psychotic  
18 features; is that correct?

19 A. No. Given the information they were privy to, I saw  
20 how they came to that conclusion. I am privy to more  
21 information.

22 Q. Okay. So what was the basis for your diagnosis,  
23 then, of schizoaffective disorder bipolar type?

24 A. Mr. Duncan has experienced symptoms of mental  
25 illness in 2008. At that time he was described as

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 manic. He was in treatment with an outpatient  
2 psychiatrist from, I believe, 2008 to 2011. At that  
3 time he presented with symptoms of mania and psychosis.  
4 He was admitted to Peachford Hospital in Atlanta in 2009  
5 with symptoms of mania and psychosis. Then, of course,  
6 he was evaluated by Dr. Brauman at the time he presented  
7 with symptoms of mania and psychosis.

8 I was also able to get collateral information  
9 from his family, particularly regarding his instances of  
10 mania and his particular delusions, and was able to get  
11 information from his son, Kyle, that there are times  
12 when he is not manic, but he still continued having very  
13 persistent fixed delusions that do not vary over time.

14 Q. Would you describe his delusions as bazaar or  
15 nonbazaar?

16 A. Most of his delusions are nonbazaar. He believes  
17 that he is being monitored via technology. He believes  
18 that people are following him, that people may want to  
19 murder him or his children.

20 In the past he has exhibited some arguably  
21 bazaar delusions in that he believes that he was the  
22 fourth component of the universe and part of the Holy  
23 Trinity, but most of his delusions and the delusions  
24 that I have observed have been what we would classify as  
25 nonbazaar.



J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 Q. And did you get information from his family  
2 regarding delusions that they believed he had suffered  
3 from or he indicated to them or exhibited in their  
4 presence?

5 A. Yes. In particular, the one that I mentioned  
6 before, he told his wife that he believes he was part of  
7 the Holy Trinity, God the Father, Son and Holy Ghost.  
8 He believed he was the fourth component of the  
9 universe. He believed that a judge in Cobb County was  
10 murdered in relation to his knowledge of Robert Rose.  
11 He believes he is the grandson of Einstein. There are  
12 other examples if you would like.

13 Q. No, that's fine. So he has both bazaar and  
14 nonbazaar delusions. That's essentially what your  
15 testimony is; is that correct?

16 A. You just cut out, I'm sorry.

17 Q. I'm sorry. Let me speak more clearly. He has both  
18 bazaar and nonbazaar delusions; is that correct?

19 A. Yes, nonbazaar for the most part.

20 Q. When you say nonbazaar, what's the nature of the  
21 nonbazaar delusions?

22 A. It's something that could possibly happen. However  
23 unlikely, it is possible.

24 Q. And are you familiar with the diagnosis of  
25 delusional disorder?

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 A. I am.

2 Q. Okay. And you did not diagnose Mr. Duncan with  
3 delusional disorder; is that correct?

4 A. That is correct.

5 Q. And he has never been diagnosed with that disorder  
6 based on your review of his records; is that correct?

7 A. That is correct.

8 Q. And how is delusional disorder different from  
9 schizoaffective disorder or bipolar or other such  
10 diagnoses that have been made in Mr. Duncan's case?

11 A. Delusional disorder is very rare. It's present in  
12 .03 percent of the population. People who exhibit  
13 delusional disorder are very functional. They often do  
14 not come to care because they do not believe that  
15 there's anything wrong with them. They often do not  
16 meet criteria for involuntary commitment because they  
17 are so functional.

18 The diagnostic criteria, according to the DSM,  
19 require that they have nonbazaar delusions, and it also  
20 requires that criterion A for schizophrenia has never  
21 been met. It also requires that mood episodes have  
22 occurred concurrent with delusions and has been brief in  
23 duration to the delusional period.

24 No mental health professional has diagnosed  
25 Mr. Duncan with delusional disorder because a diagnosis

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 of delusional disorder would be inaccurate. You cannot  
2 diagnose delusional disorder when criterion A for  
3 schizophrenia has been met. You cannot diagnose  
4 delusional disorder when there is a strong reason for a  
5 person's course of illness.

6 Q. All right. What exactly are the symptoms of  
7 schizophrenia that Mr. Duncan exhibits?

8 A. Mr. Duncan, his most prominent symptoms are  
9 delusions, and also he exhibits thought  
10 disorganization. His thoughts become tangential,  
11 circumstantial, disorganized. So those are the  
12 criterion A symptoms that Mr. Duncan exhibits.

13 Q. And what about the symptoms of mania that he  
14 exhibits?

15 A. So symptoms of mania would not be criteria for  
16 schizophrenia, and the reason why we have him diagnosed  
17 with schizoaffective disorder bipolar type is because  
18 that reflects the combination of both the psychosis and  
19 the mood component.

20 The symptoms of mania that he exhibits, both  
21 with myself and various times in his history, include  
22 irritability, grandiosity, pressured speech, flight of  
23 ideas, increased polarized activity, distractibility,  
24 insomnia. He also has exhibited risky behavior in the  
25 past, including skiing at great speeds. He's also done

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 unusual things according to his family as trying to  
2 leave a waitress a \$1 million tip.

3 Q. All right. Thank you, Dr. Volin. In the report you  
4 submitted, or the two reports, did you express an  
5 opinion as to whether Mr. Duncan is competent to stand  
6 trial?

7 A. Yes, I did.

8 Q. And what is your opinion?

9 A. My opinion is that he is not competent to stand  
10 trial.

11 Q. And why is that?

12 A. Mr. Duncan, because of his delusions, does not have  
13 a rational understanding of the consequences of the case  
14 against him. He doesn't have a rational understanding  
15 of his situation in relation to the proceedings. He  
16 believes that various court officials, including his  
17 attorney, are involved in a conspiracy with Robert  
18 Rose. He believes that the federal court does not have  
19 jurisdiction over him, that only a military court could  
20 have jurisdiction over him. He also believes that  
21 various court officials have an influence, even both the  
22 Atlanta judge who was murdered because of Mr. Duncan's  
23 knowledge of Robert Rose.

24 He also believed that at any point in time the  
25 FBI is going to come get him and put him in witness

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 protection. He also believes that his arrest was not  
2 valid.

3 Q. All right. And in your report did you express an  
4 opinion as to whether Mr. Duncan's competence can be  
5 restored?

6 A. I did. Mr. Duncan suffers from a psychotic  
7 disorder, schizoaffective disorder bipolar type. That  
8 illness is very treatable with antipsychotic medication,  
9 so it's my opinion he can be restored.

10 Q. Okay. And is that based on your experience?

11 A. It is based on countless double-blind placebo  
12 studies; it is based on his results on medication in the  
13 past; it is based on studies that have demonstrated the  
14 restorability of pretrial witnesses with psychotic  
15 illness.

16 Q. Has Mr. Duncan taken the psychotropic medications  
17 well at Butner?

18 A. Briefly he took the medication Risperdal during the  
19 previous evaluation period. I believe that was probably  
20 either in mid-July or early August 2012. In addition,  
21 he took one dose of the antipsychotic medication  
22 Aripiprazole or Abilify when he was most recently  
23 admitted to our facility.

24 Q. But did treatment with those drugs have any  
25 noticeable effect?

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 A. He took those medications so briefly that it would  
2 be difficult to say what effects he had. I can tell you  
3 what he complained of.

4 Q. That's fine if you want to tell us that, but he did  
5 not take the medication long enough to have any  
6 beneficial effect; would that be correct?

7 A. That is correct.

8 Q. Do you have an opinion as to whether Mr. Duncan can  
9 be restored to competence without psychotropic  
10 medications?

11 A. Yes. I do not believe he can be restored to  
12 competence without psychotropic medications.

13 Q. Why is that, Dr. Volin?

14 A. Psychotic illness requires treatment with  
15 antipsychotic medications. Talk therapy and other  
16 modalities do not work to attenuate a psychotic  
17 symptoms.

18 Therapy such as Harmon behavioral therapy has  
19 been shown to be beneficial as adjunctive treatment to  
20 antipsychotic medication in that they help the patient  
21 work through problems, they help the patient understand  
22 the importance of medication and treatment compliance,  
23 but they do not on their own attenuate psychotic  
24 symptoms.

25 Q. And do you have an opinion as to whether Mr. Duncan

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 can be administered psychotropic medications orally in  
2 order to restore him to competence?

3 A. Any method of administration of antipsychotic  
4 medication would be likely to restore him to competence,  
5 whether that be oral or injectable.

6 Q. Okay. But in your experience has he been willing to  
7 take the medication orally?

8 A. He has not been willing to take medication orally  
9 after he tried the Aripiprazole for one dose. So that  
10 is not something he's been willing to do.

11 I'm sorry. I'm getting a message that says,  
12 "Scheduled meeting ends in ten minutes. Please call  
13 video support."

14 MS. STERLING: Thank you very much, Dr. Volin.  
15 We will take care of that.

16 Are we okay?

17 THE COURT: Yes.

18 MS. STERLING: Okay. Thank you.

19 BY MS. STERLING:

20 Q. Now, the report that you prepared with Dr. Patole,  
21 that outlined a treatment plan for Mr. Duncan as far as  
22 medication; is that correct?

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. And without going into all of the details of the  
25 treatment plan, did you prepare that with Dr. Patole, or

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 is it something you prepared together, or did she  
2 prepare it and you reviewed it? How was that  
3 accomplished?

4 A. The medical analysis *Sell* section of the report was  
5 written by me. She has read it and reviewed it and may  
6 have added some to it, but the *Sell* section which begins  
7 on page 20.

8 Q. And so that would include the treatment plan,  
9 correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Okay. And you said the treatment plan that you  
12 outlined gives a step-by-step procedure for medicating  
13 Mr. Duncan; is that correct?

14 A. That's correct.

15 Q. And there's a procedure to be followed if he refuses  
16 to take oral medication or initially agrees and then  
17 decides not to cooperate; is that correct?

18 A. That's correct.

19 Q. And should he be involuntarily medicated, the Court  
20 indicates a plan for that process including various  
21 medications that would be used or could be used in order  
22 of preference; is that correct?

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. And that treatment plan for each of these  
25 medications, specifically for Haldol, Fluphenazine-- I



J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 may be mispronouncing it --and Risperdal, gives detailed  
2 information about dosage, about the frequency of dosage  
3 and the likelihood that medication will be required  
4 before he was restored to competence; is that correct?

5 A. That's correct.

6 Q. And does the plan also take into account the  
7 possible side effects of each of these medications?

8 A. Yes, it does.

9 Q. And it also provides a plan or a method of dealing  
10 with those side effects; is that correct?

11 A. Yes, it does.

12 Q. Just very briefly on the side effects, there are two  
13 types of medications that you mentioned there, Haldol  
14 and-- help me with the pronunciation --Fluphenazine.  
15 Those are first generation psychotropic medications, are  
16 they not?

17 A. I'm having trouble understanding you. Did you ask  
18 me if Haldol and Fluphenazine are first generation  
19 medications?

20 Q. Yes.

21 A. They are.

22 Q. Okay. And the Risperidone, the Risperdal, is second  
23 generation; is that correct?

24 A. That is correct.

25 Q. There are slightly different side effects for the

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 first generation and second generation of drugs; is that  
2 correct?

3 A. When looked at as a higher class, then the side  
4 effects do differ. However, Risperidone in particular  
5 does have a similar side effect profile to Haloperidol.  
6 I can go into more detail about it if you like.

7 MS. STERLING: Your Honor, at this point I can  
8 ask her more questions. I believe we have gone through  
9 this a lot with the last witness. I also don't know when  
10 the Court wants to take a break.

11 THE COURT: What the Court is going to try to do  
12 is try to let you finish your direct exam or we are going  
13 to try to see if we can finish the witness. I don't know  
14 whether we can make it, but we are going to try.

15 MS. STERLING: Okay. We are going to try.

16 BY MS. STERLING:

17 Q. If you could, Dr. Volin, tell us very briefly about  
18 the side effects of the various medications and the  
19 methods outlined in the treatment plan for dealing with  
20 those side effects.

21 A. Okay. Firstly, if the Court were to grant  
22 involuntary medication, the first thing that would  
23 happen-- and let me clarify. It is very likely that I  
24 will not be the person administering his medications, so  
25 I am going to advocate to the Court on what I would do

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 if I was the person prescribing it and also what the  
2 standard of care both in the community and our  
3 institution would be.

4 So if the Court were to grant prescribing  
5 involuntary medication, the first thing that would  
6 happen is that order would be discussed with him. It  
7 would be explained to Mr. Duncan that if he did not  
8 choose the medication orally, that an injectable  
9 medication would be chosen for him.

10 It is very often in that situation, even with  
11 patients who have refused oral medications in the past,  
12 that when they know an injectable medication will be  
13 administered on refusal that they do take the time to  
14 choose an oral medication. So the first thing that would  
15 happen is he would be offered the choice of the various  
16 formulary antipsychotic oral medications, and their risk  
17 and benefits and various side effect profiles would be  
18 discussed with him.

19 That being said, we can look at the psychotic  
20 medication as first generation or second generation or  
21 the individual antipsychotic medications themselves. For  
22 example, the medication he's been on in the past, Abilify  
23 or Aripiprazole has a very favorable side effect profile  
24 and is often chosen for that reason.

25 If you look at sedation, sedation with Abilify

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 has been reported at about 6 percent, whereas sedation on  
2 Risperdal has been recorded at 5 to 11 percent. So those  
3 are comparables depending on which studies you look at.

4           If you look at extrapyramidal symptoms, and  
5 these are the movement side effects of antipsychotic  
6 medications, Parkinsonism, I have heard, is about 18 to  
7 25 percent and Risperidone where it occurs about 5 to 16  
8 percent in Abilify. We know that those rates of  
9 extrapyramidal symptoms are higher in the first  
10 generation, particularly the high potency first  
11 generation of which Haldol and Fluphenazine are a  
12 member.

13           So the rates of extrapyramidal symptoms in  
14 Haloperidol and Fluphenazine would be higher, 21 to 31  
15 percent as opposed to the slightly lower rates of  
16 Risperidone and even lower of Abilify.

17           Another important point to bring up, and I'm  
18 only going to go through them briefly, so please tell me  
19 if you want more details. The metabolic side effects as  
20 a whole are more of a concern with the second generation  
21 than with the first, the metabolic side effects being  
22 weight gain, blood sugar abnormalities and cholesterol  
23 abnormalities. So these would be more of concern  
24 particularly with Risperidone than they would be in the  
25 first generation or in Aripiprazole. Abilify or

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 Aripiprazole has very low rates of metabolic syndrome.

2 Are there any other side effects you would like  
3 me to go into in more detail?

4 Q. Could you just briefly address the severe side  
5 effects that were listed in the report, the sudden death  
6 and the-- I'm sorry, there was another one.

7 A. So all medication has potential side effects, and  
8 what I'm about to discuss is the potentially dangerous  
9 side affects of antipsychotic medications. Please note  
10 that these have been approved as safe by the Federal  
11 Drug Administration and are prescribed everyday as an  
12 outpatient to patients all over the world.

13 We have the luxury of being a joint commission  
14 certified hospital with 24-hour nursing and 24-hour  
15 doctor care. The reason why I say that is because we  
16 are a hospital where we can monitor for these very rare  
17 but possible dangerous side effects.

18 The ones I would like to discuss are neuroleptic  
19 malignant syndrome. The rate of neuroleptic malignant  
20 syndrome, depending on how it's assigned, are .722  
21 percent of those who take antipsychotic medications.  
22 This also occurs in patients who are coming off of  
23 Parkinsonism medication and patients who take medication  
24 for vomiting.

25 The reason why we are so hypervigilant about

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 looking for neuroleptic malignant syndrome is because it  
2 can have dangerous and possibly lethal effects. The  
3 symptoms we look for are muscular rigidity, Metonia,  
4 high fever, increased blood pressure and heart rate, and  
5 lack of movement.

6 Antipsychotics also can cause abnormal heart  
7 rhythms. It is much more prominent in certain  
8 antipsychotic medications than others such as Mellaril  
9 and Gson.

10 As the antipsychotic medication causes an  
11 arrhythmia of the heart, that can in theory lead to what  
12 is called sudden death. Now, sudden death occurs both  
13 in the general healthy population and in patients who  
14 are on antipsychotic medication. It is a very, very  
15 rare event.

16 The reason why we think it's important is  
17 because you take something extremely rare and with  
18 antipsychotic medication it is still extremely rare, but  
19 there is a specifically significant increase in the  
20 risk.

21 The reason why we think that patients,  
22 particularly with schizophrenia, have still particularly  
23 small but a higher rate than the general population of  
24 sudden death is because this is a population-- not only  
25 are they taking antipsychotic medication, but they also

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 have much higher rates of smoking and much less medical  
2 care and also higher rates of obesity.

3 So the potentially dangerous side effects we  
4 look at, once again, are neuroleptic malignant syndrome  
5 and also abnormalities of cardiac conjunction or sudden  
6 death. Either of those are both incredibly rare events  
7 and something that here we have the luxury to monitor 24  
8 hours a day.

9 Q. Thank you, Dr. Volin.

10 The treatment outlines for nonvoluntary  
11 medication, injectable medication, it outlines three  
12 medications in order of preference; is that correct?

13 A. Yes. Let me explain that these are all equally  
14 efficacious medications. That order that you are  
15 calling an order of preference is based on very small  
16 factors such that Haloperidol, the reason why it was  
17 listed first is not because it's a better medication or  
18 its ratification, it's because it only needs to be  
19 administered once a month and the onset is fairly  
20 quick.

21 Fluphenazine is listed as second because the  
22 onset is very quick, but it's administered every two  
23 weeks.

24 And then Risperidone listed third not because  
25 it's the worse medication or less efficacious, but

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 because the onset, particularly for Risperidone, is much  
2 longer because of the formulation of the medication and  
3 it also has to be administered every two weeks.

4 Q. If the Court were to grant the government's motion  
5 to involuntary medicate, would the staff at Butner,  
6 which you indicated would probably not be you, would the  
7 doctors and psychiatrists use them in that order or  
8 would they use those three medications or could they  
9 change their recommendation and use different  
10 medications?

11 A. There are only three currently available long-acting  
12 injectable medications on formulary. There are various  
13 factors that could lead a professional to rank something  
14 higher than another. For example, the injectable  
15 immediate release Fluphenazine has been difficult to  
16 obtain. Therefore, Fluphenazine could be in the third  
17 box, whereas Risperdal possibly would be in the second  
18 because of the availability of medication.

19 I can't predict certain things like that right  
20 now, which is why when we submit very detailed treatment  
21 plans it doesn't necessarily take into account real  
22 world variables that we have to take into account as  
23 doctors.

24 In addition, even if Mr. Duncan were not to  
25 choose an oral medication, if he were to choose one of



J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 the three injectables, the doctor would most likely go  
2 with his choice. I know I would go with his choice,  
3 even if it did not meet my order. If he chose that one,  
4 that would be the one I would go with.

5 Q. So you listed the three injectable psychotropic  
6 medications because those are the only three that are  
7 injectable; is that correct?

8 A. I didn't hear you, I'm sorry.

9 Q. I'm sorry. The three medications you have listed  
10 are the three that are injectable. There would not be a  
11 choice for another medication because there is no other  
12 psychotropic medication that's injectable; is that  
13 correct?

14 A. The three long-acting injectables are the ones that  
15 I listed. There are other antipsychotic medications  
16 available as injectables. They are currently not on the  
17 Bureau formulary. That can change.

18 Q. Okay. So as far as the treatment plan that you have  
19 outlined with the various side effects, that would apply  
20 to another psychiatrist treating Mr. Duncan because  
21 those are the only three medications that could be used  
22 at Butner?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. All right. Thank you.

25 Dr. Volin, you indicated that you in the latest

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 report, the December 2012, performed the *Sell* analysis;  
2 is that correct?

3 A. I didn't hear you. If you are asking if I wrote  
4 that, that is correct.

5 Q. Okay. The *Sell* analysis, I want to direct your  
6 attention to that portion of the report.

7 The report indicates that-- the first question  
8 under *Sell* is whether there was an important government  
9 interest at stake. That's obviously a legal question we  
10 are not going to address with you, but I want to go to  
11 the analysis on the other four *Sell* factors and if you  
12 need to, you can make reference to your report.

13 A. Okay.

14 Q. Okay. As to the second *Sell* factor, the question  
15 being whether involuntary medication will significantly  
16 further those interests, the question for you as the  
17 treating psychiatrist is whether the medications will  
18 substantially likely render the defendant competent to  
19 stand trial and be unlikely to have side effects that  
20 will interfere with his ability to assist counsel?

21 So as to the first of that two-part criteria, in  
22 your opinion does the treatment plan for involuntarily  
23 medicating the defendant, is it substantially likely to  
24 restore the defendant's competence to stand trial?

25 A. Yes.

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 Q. Okay. And can you tell us what the basis of your  
2 opinion is?

3 A. Mr. Duncan suffers from a psychotic disorder,  
4 schizoaffective disorder. The appropriate first-line  
5 treatment for that illness is antipsychotic medication.  
6 Countless peer review subliminal placebo trials have  
7 indicated the effectiveness of antipsychotic  
8 medication.

9           Studies have also shown the restorability of  
10 patients to trial when administered involuntary  
11 medication. Particularly in his population, federal  
12 pretrial defendants have been restored to competency  
13 after an order for involuntary medication has been  
14 rendered by the Court, and also Mr. Duncan has a history  
15 responding well to antipsychotic medication according to  
16 the Peachford hospitalization records where he was  
17 admitted to inpatient service from March 28th to April  
18 4th 2009.

19           On admission he was, quote, floridly manic, very  
20 paranoid, delusional and grandiose, and just eight days  
21 later he was discharged from the inpatient  
22 hospitalization to a partial hospitalization program.

23           At the time of his discharge the doctor noted he  
24 exhibited greater insight into his illness and his sleep  
25 improved. He remained hypomanic, so without full-blown

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 mania. His paranoid delusions regarding his wife also  
2 improved. He no longer thought she was trying to kill  
3 him but did believe she wanted to financially harm him.  
4 So that is a very good example of how his senses  
5 attenuated after just eight days of medication.

6 Q. Do you have an opinion whether he could be restored  
7 to competency without the use of these psychotropic  
8 medications?

9 A. There was a radio call while you were speaking, so I  
10 missed what you were saying.

11 Q. Oh, I'm sorry. Do you have an opinion as to whether  
12 he could be restored to competence without the  
13 psychotropic medications?

14 A. Yes. Without psychotropic medication I do not  
15 believe he can be restored to competence.

16 Q. And do the psychotropic medications outlined in the  
17 report, and specifically the treatment plan, have side  
18 effects that are likely to interfere with the  
19 defendant's ability to assist counsel at trial? Do you  
20 have an opinion as to that?

21 A. I do. Antipsychotic medications actually improve  
22 cognition. They particularly improve attention and  
23 thought organization, so those should be expected to  
24 assist him at trial. There is a possibility of sedation  
25 with antipsychotic medication.

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1           As I stated before, 6 percent of patients  
2       reported fatigue on Aripiprazole or Abilify while 11  
3       percent of patients reported sedation on Risperidone.  
4       Sedation as a side effect is very easily managed. It is  
5       managed by moving the medication to nighttime. It is  
6       also managed by decreasing the dosage of the  
7       medication. And if sedation does not improve with those  
8       very simple fixes, a new medication can be chosen. But  
9       like I said, with a particular medication we are talking  
10      about, it does occur in less than 20 percent of people  
11      and it's easily managed.

12     Q.   Are you aware of any side effects from psychotropic  
13     medications that Mr. Duncan has specifically complained  
14     of that would interfere with his ability to assist  
15     counsel at trial?

16     A.   No.

17     Q.   In your opinion, Dr. Volin, are there any  
18     alternative less intrusive involuntary medications that  
19     would have a substantial likelihood of restoring the  
20     defendant's competence?

21     A.   I do not believe there are any less intrusive  
22     alternatives that would restore him to competence  
23     without psychotropic medications.

24     Q.   Have you considered any other alternatives?

25     A.   Of course we consider with all of our patients

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 whether or not other modalities might be accepted.  
2 However, it is widely accepted that psychotic symptoms  
3 require antipsychotic medication. That does not say  
4 there's no use for talk therapy. It's just that we do  
5 not expect him to engage in therapy when he does not  
6 believe that there is anything wrong with him.

7 Also, just as he cannot engage with attorneys,  
8 just as he has derailed on additional topics, he would  
9 do the same in therapy. So it's something that he would  
10 definitely have from the beginning and require  
11 medication.

12 Q. So would it be your opinion, then, under the third  
13 criteria of *Sell* that a voluntary medication, should  
14 Mr. Duncan agree to take the medication, would be  
15 necessary to further the Government's interest in  
16 proceeding to trial in this matter?

17 A. Yes, that's correct.

18 Q. Finally, do you have an opinion as to whether the  
19 voluntary medication, the medications recommended in the  
20 treatment plan, are in the defendant's best interest in  
21 light of his medical condition?

22 A. I do. Regardless of his legal proceedings, I  
23 recommend that he take antipsychotic medication for  
24 proper treatment of his illness.

25 Q. Okay. And have you considered other medical issues

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 that he has and how the medication might interact with  
2 his conditions or the medication for those conditions?

3 A. Yes. Mr. Duncan has reported preexisting restless  
4 leg syndrome. Because of the nature of the  
5 antipsychotic medication, it can worsen restless leg  
6 syndrome. So if that were the case, that he were  
7 experiencing those symptoms, I would prescribe, or  
8 whoever was assigned as his psychiatrist would  
9 prescribe, medication to treat that condition.

10 Q. Again, your report details the potential side  
11 effects, long term and short term, their likelihood and  
12 how they would be dealt with; is that correct?

13 A. That's correct.

14 Q. And what, if anything, can you say about the  
15 likelihood for his future medication, whether medication  
16 in this point would increase, decrease, or have any  
17 effect on his future ability or desire to take  
18 medication for his condition?

19 Do you understand my question?

20 A. Are you asking if taking medication would increase  
21 his desire to take medication?

22 Q. Future likelihood of voluntarily seeking medication?

23 MS. HARRIS: We object, Your Honor.

24 Speculation.

25 THE COURT: Sustained.

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 BY MS. STERLING:

2 Q. Now, you indicated if the government's motion is  
3 granted today, the treatment plan you have outlined is  
4 what will be used for the framework for medicating  
5 Mr. Duncan; is that correct?

6 A. That's correct.

7 Q. Do you know whether Mr. Duncan has been evaluated  
8 for involuntary medication under the criteria set forth  
9 in *Harper*? Has he attended any *Harper* hearings?

10 A. Yes, he has.

11 Q. And when did that occur?

12 A. March 7th, 2013.

13 Q. All right. So a report was prepared; is that  
14 correct? A report was prepared?

15 A. A memo was.

16 Q. Okay.

17 A. A memo was written by myself to the chief  
18 psychiatrist, and she prepared a report.

19 Q. Thank you. And what exactly is a *Harper* hearing?

20 A. *Washington v. Harper* allows an institution such as  
21 prisons to involuntarily medicate inmates in case of  
22 dangerousness to self or others or grave disabilities,  
23 and that requires that the inmate or the patient be  
24 dangerous within confinement. So that could be within a  
25 locked single cell.



J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1           So to rise to the level of dangerousness in that  
2 situation some examples that would rise to that level  
3 would include a diabetic who refuses to take insulin  
4 because he is paranoid and believes insulin could be  
5 poison and his blood sugar rises to a dangerous level  
6 that could impact his life.

7           Another example would be an inmate or patient  
8 who refuses food, who loses a significant amount of  
9 weight that creates electrolyte imbalance or inner organ  
10 damage.

11           Another example would be a patient actively  
12 trying to kill himself because of psychotic delusions.

13           Another example would be physically attacking a  
14 staff member, even within that confined cell.

15           So those are the type of situations that we look  
16 at that would satisfy grave disability or danger to self  
17 or others within confinement to involuntarily medicate  
18 under *Harper*.

19 Q.   And the finding in Mr. Duncan's case was what?

20 A.   The finding was that he did not meet *Harper*  
21 criteria.

22 Q.   And in fact, when you prepared the report for this  
23 Court, you indicated to the Court that you did not think  
24 that he met the *Harper* criteria for involuntary  
25 medication; is that correct?

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 A. That's correct.

2 Q. Now, in the event the Court did not grant the  
3 Government's motion today and the defendant was not to  
4 be involuntarily medicated, are you familiar with the  
5 procedures under 18 U.S.C. 4246, the evaluation that  
6 would be conducted subsequent to the proceedings today?

7 A. Yes, I am.

8 Q. Tell us what that hearing is and how that is  
9 different from what we are doing here today and what  
10 occurred in *Harper*?

11 A. The factors that we look at in *Harper* and the 4246  
12 are different than what you look at in *Washington v.*  
13 *Harper*. *Washington v. Harper*, like I said, is  
14 dangerousness to self or others or break in senility  
15 within confinement.

16 In 4246 we look at whether or not someone would  
17 be dangerous to persons or property if released because  
18 of a mental illness.

19 So that evaluation is very different. You take  
20 a very detailed history, especially in the area of  
21 history of violence, mental illness and treatment  
22 compliance, substance abuse, history of weapon use,  
23 social support and institutional adjustment. You also  
24 review what is called an HCR-20. That is a measurement,  
25 an assessment tool to try to judge someone's risk of

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 dangerousness in the community.

2 All of this information is presented to a risk  
3 panel that consists of the evaluator who presents the  
4 information, the patient, and also the chief  
5 psychiatrist and the deputy chief psychologist. That  
6 risk panel then makes recommendations to the evaluator  
7 to determine whether or not that person meets the  
8 criteria for 4246.

9 Q. Okay. And what is 4246? You said meets the  
10 criteria. What exactly is 4246?

11 A. Okay. That is, does the individual because of  
12 mental illness pose a risk of danger to others or the  
13 property of others if released?

14 Q. And if he does pose such a risk, it would require  
15 hospitalization; is that correct?

16 A. Please repeat?

17 Q. I'm sorry. Does it not provide that the person, the  
18 individual in question, if they do pose a risk pursuant  
19 to those factors under 4246, would be hospitalized  
20 rather than released? Is that correct?

21 A. Committed within the federal system. But also  
22 there's one step after the evaluator and the risk panel  
23 render their opinion. You do have to appear before a  
24 judge, and the judge makes the final determination.

25 Q. Okay. And that type of hearing would occur after

J. Volin, M.D. - Direct

1 the proceeding we are involved in today, after a *Sell*  
2 hearing, is that correct, or could occur?

3 A. Yes. It would have to be requested.

4 Q. Okay. So we haven't had that hearing and you don't  
5 have any opinion as to what would likely happen under  
6 4246, is that correct, that hearing?

7 A. That's correct, I do not have an opinion on that.

8 Q. All right. One final question, Dr. Volin. Do any  
9 of the findings, opinions or recommendations contained  
10 in the reports filed with the Court that you prepared  
11 with Dr. Patole, the September and December reports, has  
12 anything changed since the time you filed those reports?

13 A. Well, like I said before, his last time he was here  
14 he was less manic than on other interviews. The only  
15 other change is in the *Sell* section I had mentioned that  
16 because I had personally witnessed him taking a dose of  
17 Risperdal, that him having to take a dose of Risperdal  
18 as a test dose would not be necessary. But so much time  
19 has passed that I think his next treating psychiatrist  
20 would consider whether or not another test dose needed  
21 to happen. That would be their clinical judgment and  
22 their clinical opinion.

23 One thing they would likely look at is has our  
24 formulation of Risperidone changed? Are we using a  
25 different manufacturer since he last took it? So that

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 would be the only thing that I would mention as a  
2 possible difference were he to come back.

3 MS. STERLING: Okay. Thank you, Dr. Volin.

4 THE COURT: Cross?

5 CROSS-EXAMINATION

6 BY MS. HARRIS:

7 Q. Good afternoon, Dr. Volin?

8 A. Good afternoon.

9 Q. Mr. Duncan is not dangerous, according to the *Harper*  
10 hearing, correct?

11 A. He does not meet *Harper* criterion, that is correct.

12 Q. And he's never had any type of physical  
13 confrontation or altercation at Butner, correct?

14 A. That is correct.

15 Q. Except for the prescription medication and his  
16 noncompliance with prescribed medication, he complies  
17 with everyone else's orders and requests; isn't that  
18 true?

19 A. That's correct.

20 Q. And I want to ask you about this diagnosis. You and  
21 Dr. Patole arrived at the diagnosis together?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. And you said it was based on several different  
24 things, including clinical interviews by you and  
25 Dr. Patole?

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 A. That's correct.

2 Q. And that there were variations in his level of  
3 mania?

4 A. Yes. So, I can explain that further if you like.

5 Q. Well, that's what you testified to on direct, right,  
6 you said that sometimes he exhibited pressured speech,  
7 insomnia and he was difficult to redirect?

8 A. Yes. For most of the summer and fall of 2012 he was  
9 manic or hypomanic.

10 Q. Okay. Now, one of the things that you mentioned on  
11 direct was that you had extensive collateral information  
12 that allowed you to make this diagnosis of  
13 schizoaffective disorder?

14 A. That's correct.

15 Q. You actually reached-- you and Dr. Patole actually  
16 reached that diagnosis after only two months of  
17 observing Mr. Duncan, right?

18 A. Yes. We had that observational data; we had  
19 information from his family, particularly from his  
20 ex-wife and his son Kyle; we had the information from  
21 Dr. Hege. We also had Dr. Brauman's evaluation. We had  
22 discovery information.

23 Q. All of that except for your observations at Butner,  
24 those had been available to Dr. Brauman at the Bureau of  
25 Prisons facility in New York; isn't that true?

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 A. If you look at Dr. Brauman's report, she did not  
2 have access to-- give me one second and I will find it.

3 Q. Okay.

4 A. So she had records from a Dr. Westerman, who is a  
5 police doctor, and a Dr. Schwartz, an endocrinologist.  
6 If I am correct, she did not have the records from  
7 Dr. Hege and did not have the records from Peachford,  
8 she did not interview his family.

9 Q. Excuse me for just one moment.

10 A. I'm sorry, Ms. Harris. I didn't hear you.

11 Q. Didn't Dr. Brauman have the Dr. Hege-- I'm sorry,  
12 I'm looking for the page in the report --Dr. Hege's  
13 records?

14 A. I do not see it listed on page 2 of her report.

15 Q. Thank you, Dr. Volin. I may have to come back to  
16 that in a minute. I don't want to take up our time now  
17 on that point.

18 With respect to this diagnosis, to have  
19 schizoaffective disorder Mr. Duncan would have had to  
20 have had previous manic depressive mood disorder symptoms  
21 as well as concurrent schizophrenia criterion A symptoms,  
22 right?

23 A. Yes. It requires, I believe-- let me get the DSM  
24 out.

25 Okay. Schizoaffective disorder requires either

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 a major depressive episode, a manic episode, or a mixed  
2 episode concurrent within the criterion A for  
3 schizophrenia and does not require multiple episodes.

4 Q. It's possible, Dr. Volin, for an individual to have  
5 two different mental health diagnoses; isn't that true?

6 A. Yes, of course.

7 Q. Okay. And so I understand that you don't agree that  
8 Mr. Duncan would correctly be diagnosed with delusional  
9 disorder based on your interviews and your analysis,  
10 right?

11 A. I am unaware of anyone ever diagnosing Mr. Duncan  
12 with delusional disorder.

13 Q. Okay. My next question is, isn't it possible for  
14 someone to have delusional disorder as well as bipolar  
15 disorder at the same time?

16 A. So, delusional disorder requires, according to the  
17 DSM, that if mood episodes have occurred concurrently  
18 with delusions, their total duration has been brief  
19 relative to the duration of his delusional period.  
20 Therefore, someone who has had criteria for a major mood  
21 disorder such as bipolar disorder, it would be improper  
22 to diagnose simultaneous delusional disorder because of  
23 the DSM criteria.

24 Q. So if I understand you correctly, if you have  
25 delusions and mood components, then this diagnosis takes



J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 into account both of them?

2 A. Okay. What I'm saying is if you follow the DSM,  
3 which is what we try to do in my profession, criterion  
4 D, a delusional mood disorder, mood episodes have a part  
5 and partly with delusions. Their total delusions have  
6 been brief compared to the total duration of the  
7 delusional period.

8 So if you look at Mr. Duncan in particular, his  
9 mood symptoms have been prominent since 2008.

10 Q. Dr. Volin, the antipsychotics that you think will  
11 treat the schizoaffective disorder in Mr. Duncan, they  
12 will mostly address his mood symptoms, correct, the  
13 disorganized speech-- I'm sorry, the manic symptoms?

14 A. So, antipsychotic medication are effective both in  
15 the treatment of psychosis and the mania. Antipsychotic  
16 medications are the first-line treatment for psychotic  
17 illness. Some of the antipsychotic medications have  
18 also been approved as modern therapy for treatment of  
19 mania. So the antipsychotic medications treat both.

20 Q. These delusions that Mr. Duncan has, you have  
21 classified them as mostly nonbazaar?

22 A. Yes. The delusions that he has exhibited in  
23 clinical interviews with me have been nonbazaar.

24 Q. And you have been working with him since July of  
25 last year, correct?

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 A. That is correct.

2 Q. We are saying that they are nonbazaar because they  
3 are grounded in reality in things that actually happened  
4 to him and real people who exist, right?

5 A. By definition, a delusion is a break with reality.  
6 We classify bazaar versus nonbazaar when it is possible  
7 that this thing could happen. Someone may believe he is  
8 being conspired against and followed by the FBI that is  
9 not necessarily grounded in reality. So a delusion is a  
10 break with reality. However, if it could possibly  
11 happen in real life, we classify it as nonbazaar.

12 Q. Okay. So Mr. Duncan's beliefs, you are saying, are  
13 not grounded in reality, but they are possible?

14 A. Yes. They are both not grounded in reality and  
15 possible.

16 Q. This is the main thing that you are saying is  
17 interfering with his ability to be competent; isn't that  
18 correct?

19 A. His focus on these delusions to the exclusion of  
20 everything else is directly related to his incompetence.

21 Q. Isn't it true, Dr. Volin, that these thoughts and  
22 beliefs are never going to stop bothering or haunting  
23 Mr. Duncan?

24 A. That is not true. Delusions are a treatable  
25 component of a psychotic illness.

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. Even if they are not bazaar?

2 A. Yes, absolutely. Delusions are a treatable  
3 component of a psychotic illness.

4 Q. When he was treated at Charter Peachford and  
5 Dr. Hege on antipsychotics he continued to have  
6 delusions, these particular delusions; isn't that true?

7 A. That's a mischaracterization of the record from the  
8 2009 hospitalization.

9 If I can quote you directly from it, his  
10 delusions in particular improved. Let me just find it  
11 real quick.

12 Okay. "At the time of discharge he exhibited  
13 greater insight into his illness and seemed to improve.  
14 He remained hypomanic but without full-fledged mania.  
15 His paranoid delusions concerning his wife also  
16 improved. He no longer thought she was trying to kill  
17 him but did believe she wanted to financially harm  
18 him." The delusions improved.

19 Q. And he continued to be hypomanic, which means that  
20 he was exhibiting symptoms of mania, correct?

21 A. Hypomanic is not full-fledged mania. Hypomania is  
22 an attenuated version of mania, in effect.

23 Q. It could be referred to as a baby mania or not as  
24 bad as maybe full-blown mania, correct?

25 A. Yes.

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. Okay. But it's still characterized by some  
2 disorganized thoughts, impulsive behaviors and  
3 uninterrupted speech?

4 A. I can tell you exactly what he was at that time if  
5 that's helpful.

6 Okay. "On April 4th, 2009, the day he was  
7 discharged--" I'm reading directly from Peachford  
8 Behavioral Health in Atlanta discharge summary. "April  
9 4th, patient not in denial of his illness, sleeping  
10 better, but still with hypomanic symptoms but no  
11 full-blown mania. He was denying hallucinations.  
12 Denying suicidal or homicidal ideations. Family--"

13 Q. Could you slow down a little bit, please?

14 A. I'm reading from the Peachford Health System  
15 discharge summary, the date he was discharged from  
16 inpatient April 4th. "Patient not in denial of his  
17 illness. Sleeping better, but still with hypomanic  
18 symptoms but no full-blown mania. He was denying  
19 hallucinations, denying suicidal or homicidal  
20 ideations.

21 "Family section: With son, Kyle, and sister,  
22 Katie. His brother died. Katie is in Maine. His  
23 brother is in North Carolina. Family told Katie that he  
24 has been in denial of his illness for over a year now  
25 and they want him to accept his illness, also take his

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 medications. Patient is still hypomanic. No longer  
2 "believes that his wife wants to physically harm him.  
3 Now says she wants to financially harm him. Patient is  
4 willing to start PHT on April 5th." So they did not  
5 specifically discuss his particular hypomanic symptoms  
6 at that time."

7 Q. But that discharge summary does note twice that he  
8 was still hypomanic, right?

9 A. I don't know if it-- certainly in the section I read  
10 he was hypomanic.

11 Q. His delusions were better, but they still persisted  
12 to some degree?

13 A. So the particular delusion that necessitated his  
14 admission that he believed his wife wanted to kill him,  
15 that had resolved. He believed she wanted to  
16 financially harm him. That was in the context of a  
17 divorce.

18 Q. He has both types of beliefs about Mr. Rose and  
19 Ms. Bashama. Number one, that they are going to  
20 physically harm him; and number two, they are going to  
21 financially harm him. Isn't that true?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Additionally, when he was under the care of Dr. Hege  
24 from 2008 to 2011, he still had persistent symptoms,  
25 even though he was medicated and showed some

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 improvement?

2 A. Mr. Duncan, according to his son, Kyle, and also  
3 according to Dr. Hege's records, was largely  
4 noncompliant. The doctors at Peachford were able to  
5 interview Dr. Hege regarding the treatment of his  
6 patient, and I can read exactly what they said in their  
7 discharge summary. They said, "In speaking to Dr. Hege,  
8 he reported that he has tried starting the patient on  
9 Abilify, but the patient refused to take the prescribed  
10 dose and kept taking smaller and smaller amounts which  
11 has resulted in manic decompensation." So he was  
12 largely noncompliant when he was under the care of  
13 Dr. Hege outpatient.

14 Q. So he began decreasing his dose on his own of  
15 Abilify when under the care of Dr. Hege?

16 A. According to the Peachford records, that's correct.

17 Q. But he was taking some amount of the Abilify, and my  
18 original point was he still had persistent delusions at  
19 that period of time?

20 A. It would be erroneous to conclude that a medication  
21 was ineffective when it's not being taken properly.

22 Q. Well, let's talk about that. One of the reasons  
23 that he did not take the medication as prescribed is  
24 because he experienced side effects and complained of  
25 side effects; isn't that true?

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 A. It is very common for patients who are manic or  
2 hypomanic to complain of side effects of sedation when  
3 in actuality the speed of their thoughts and speech and  
4 actions has returned to a more normal level.

5 If you look at his family, the lateral report  
6 from that time, his son reported that he was sleeping  
7 very little, that he was engaged in a lot of bold  
8 directed behavior that was not actually productive  
9 behavior, and you see that simultaneously with his  
10 complaining of side effects of sedation we have a family  
11 report that he's not sleeping. So that would be  
12 inconsistent information.

13 Q. Do I understand you correctly that you are saying  
14 even though he was complaining of sedation side effects,  
15 his family's reports tend to show that he maybe wasn't  
16 experiencing that? Is that what you are saying?

17 A. That's correct.

18 Q. When he was given both Abilify and Risperdal at  
19 Butner under your care, he also complained of side  
20 effects, isn't that true?

21 A. That is correct.

22 Q. And in the report, the report from Butner that you  
23 and Dr. Patole submitted, it's opined that he should  
24 also be given a mood stabilizer in conjunction with the  
25 antipsychotic in order to render him competent; isn't

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 that true?

2 A. We say that mood stabilizers can also be helpful. I  
3 do not think he has to have a mood stabilizer to be  
4 rendered competent.

5 In our study and the studies I have reviewed  
6 most patients were restored to competence on one  
7 antipsychotic medication. Very few of the patients also  
8 had a concomitant mood stabilizer on board that resulted  
9 in their competence. So I do think they can be restored  
10 on antipsychotic therapy. As I stated before,  
11 antipsychotics are approved for treatment both for  
12 psychosis and for mania.

13 Q. Dr. Volin, isn't it correct, however, that in the  
14 past when he has improved and his symptoms have improved  
15 under Dr. Hege's care and under Charter Peachford's  
16 care, that he was also being given mood stabilizers?

17 A. Yes. So in the Charter Peachford he improved in  
18 eight days, and he was given not only the Abilify and  
19 Depakote that he was taking there at the end of the  
20 eight days, he was also additionally prescribed other  
21 medications.

22 It is not uncommon for inpatient hospitals who  
23 are very expensive to try to treat people very quickly.  
24 I would not have the burden of trying to render  
25 Mr. Duncan competent in eight days. Therefore, I would



J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 give the antipsychotic medication time to work to make  
2 sure that those other medications were actually needed.

3 Q. But regardless, you or the staff at Butner FMC  
4 cannot give mood stabilizers involuntarily; isn't that  
5 correct?

6 A. Yes. There is no injectable mood stabilizer, that  
7 is correct.

8 Q. Dr. Volin, when we spoke about alternative therapies  
9 and you said that talk therapy does not work for his  
10 particular diagnosis and that cognitive behavioral  
11 therapy needs the addition of medication, would you  
12 agree that, therefore, you are not considering these as  
13 alternatives to medication?

14 A. So the various therapies that would be used in  
15 conjunction when they have antipsychotic medication,  
16 some have shown to be effective, some have not.  
17 However, it is widely accepted in my profession that you  
18 cannot treat psychotic symptoms with therapy or other  
19 less alternative measures alone. It simply does not  
20 work. So I cannot divorce myself from that knowledge,  
21 even though as a mental health professional I understand  
22 and respect the value of talk therapy. I think that's  
23 something that you try to engage with every time you sit  
24 down with a patient. You try to create a therapy that  
25 aligns, you try to assist the patient; you try to help

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 the patient see things that he cannot or will not see.

2 Q. And so in your expert opinion, you are saying that  
3 these alternative therapies are not an option for  
4 Mr. Duncan?

5 A. They are not going to restore him to competence.  
6 They are not going to treat his psychotic illness the  
7 way in which medication would.

8 Q. Doctor, when we are talking about the effectiveness  
9 of the suggested or recommended medications, you relied  
10 on a couple of studies; isn't that correct?

11 A. The studies listed in the report is all restoration  
12 of competence. There are countless double-blind placebo  
13 trials that have shown the effects of antipsychotic  
14 medications in patients with psychotic illness that I do  
15 not reference.

16 Q. Did you reference in the report the Herbel study and  
17 the Cochrane study?

18 A. Yes. There is a 2008 Herbel and Stelmach and 2012  
19 Cochrane and Herbel. They are specifically referencing  
20 pretrial inmate restoration to competence.

21 Q. Those particular studies that are cited in the  
22 report as a basis for the effectiveness, those were not  
23 double-blind placebo studies like you just mentioned,  
24 were they?

25 A. They were not. Those were retrospective analysis.

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 Because this particular population is not a very large  
2 population, it would be almost impossible to get a  
3 double-blind placebo controlled trial. And because  
4 where you may have two percent of the entire population  
5 with schizophrenia, how many of those are federal  
6 pretrial inmates? So when you have such a small sample  
7 size, that necessitates this type of study.

8 If you look at the restoration literature, most  
9 of them were retrospective reviews.

10 Q. I am going to ask you another question about the  
11 medications. Some of the side effects that you went  
12 through on direct of the recommended medications are the  
13 Parkinsonism effects?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Okay. With respect to Haldol, which is the No. 1  
16 recommended involuntary medication, isn't it the  
17 practice for Cogentin to be given to counteract the  
18 Parkinsonism symptoms?

19 A. If those symptoms are present, it would be a  
20 practice to administer Cogentin.

21 Q. Okay. And Cogentin itself, some studies indicated  
22 that that can then cause Tardive Dyskinesia; isn't that  
23 correct?

24 A. You would have to direct me to the study because if  
25 someone-- it would be difficult to separate out people

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 who had never been on antipsychotic medication and  
2 people who had been given Cogentin alone. So if you are  
3 noting a correlation, we would have to make sure that  
4 there was not a compounding factor in the psychotic  
5 medications.

6 Q. Okay. With respect to side effects, though, can we  
7 agree that Mr. Duncan's main complaints thus far have  
8 been lethargy, sedation, being zombie-like, etc.?

9 A. Yes. He often had some very unusual complaints  
10 after the dosage of Abilify that were not sedation.

11 Q. But the ones you would be most concerned about or  
12 expect him to have would be these lethargy, feeling like  
13 a zombie or feeling sedated?

14 A. I am most concerned about the symptoms that the  
15 patient presents. I am, of course, very concerned about  
16 the possible symptoms that might indicate a serious  
17 condition. So I can't say that I'm more concerned with  
18 sedation than I am with another symptom. My focus is  
19 going to be on what I observe within the physical exam  
20 and other observations and what the patient is telling  
21 me.

22 Q. But sedation has been specifically complained about  
23 by Mr. Duncan in the past with antipsychotics; isn't  
24 that true?

25 A. Yes.

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 Q. And for an individual experiencing this side effect,  
2 that person could hypothetically have a difficulty in  
3 sitting at counsel table and listening to witnesses and  
4 comprehending and observing testimony; isn't that  
5 correct?

6 A. That is correct. I would also like to note that  
7 antipsychotic medications actually improve cognition.  
8 So if Mr. Duncan were experiencing a side effect of  
9 sedation here after treatment, we would monitor that  
10 very different ways. We would get a sleep log. We have  
11 the advantage of 24-hour nursing. We would get a sleep  
12 log that would monitor all of the times that he was  
13 sleeping throughout the 24-hour day.

14 I would also-- we could administer  
15 neuropsychological testing to see if there was a lack of  
16 concentration in a particular area that counsel would be  
17 interested in. We would also do interviews various  
18 different times of day and determine when these symptoms  
19 were most prominent, and we would address that by  
20 changing the dosage or the timing of his medication or  
21 changing the medication altogether if that were going to  
22 be a barrier to the competence.

23 Q. But were he to continue to experience side effects  
24 that render him zombie-like, wouldn't that interfere  
25 with his ability to relate to his attorney if he's

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 hearing contradictory or untrue information, relating  
2 that in a coherent and organized manner and being able  
3 to respond to questions from his counsel?

4 A. So, I have never observed Mr. Duncan behaving in a  
5 zombie-like fashion. The records that I reviewed from  
6 previous evaluators and the treatment at Charter  
7 Peachford did not reflect that he was zombie-like after  
8 treatment with medication.

9 Of course, if someone were oversedated, we would  
10 address that immediately.

11 Q. Isn't it true that his wife relayed to either you or  
12 Dr. Patole that when he was medicated in the past, he  
13 was zombie-like?

14 A. When he was initially treated-- hold on. Let me get  
15 her interview.

16 Q. It's on pages 6 and 7 of the report, Doctor.

17 A. Okay. So when he was initially treated prior to  
18 treatment with Dr. Hege in 2008, Mrs. Duncan indicated  
19 that the medication made him a zombie. I did not have  
20 those records from that particular outpatient provider  
21 to review.

22 Q. Dr. Volin, you mentioned that if the Court grants  
23 the government's motion, you as Mr. Duncan's treating  
24 doctor, if you were his treating doctor, would give him  
25 the opportunity to choose his medication, whether it was

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 injected or taken orally?

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. Is that Butner's protocol?

4 A. If it were one of the approved formulary and  
5 available antipsychotic medications.

6 Q. What I'm asking, if that is the protocol of the  
7 hospital you are leaving, would the next doctor have to  
8 follow that protocol of allowing him the choice?

9 A. Yes. That is our standard here. We do not-- as  
10 psychiatrists, as doctors, we do not like forcing  
11 patients to take medication. If he were to choose an  
12 oral medication, we would all be delighted.

13 Q. But were he to be involuntarily medicated and not  
14 comply with the Court's order, the standard procedures  
15 at Butner require that he be strapped down and held down  
16 while he's injected; isn't that correct?

17 A. So, the forced medication procedures, if they are  
18 required, eventually a nurse would offer it to him and  
19 then he might say no. People may offer it again and  
20 explain to him what would happen if he chose not to  
21 comply. If what was called a forced *Sell* move was  
22 required, then the officers would be on camera, the  
23 nurse and the doctor would be interviewed on camera.  
24 All of the procedures would take place on camera.

25 Depending on whether or not this was within his

J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 cell or in a nurse's station, it would be very unlikely  
2 he would be strapped down, but the officers might  
3 physically restrain him while he was being injected with  
4 the medication by the nurse. And, like I said, all this  
5 would occur on camera.

6 Q. And you have no knowledge of whether the local  
7 jail that he would be transported to after Butner  
8 would continue to administer the medications that  
9 had been successful for him at Butner; isn't that  
10 true?

11 A. I cannot force any other doctor to prescribe the  
12 same medication that I would prescribe. However, if  
13 there's concern that he is not going to take his  
14 medication or not going be administering them properly  
15 after restoration of competence, the Court can request  
16 that he remain at our site for the competency hearing  
17 and that occur via video conference if noncompliance or  
18 not being administered medication at a local jail is a  
19 concern.

20 Q. Finally, Dr. Volin, you opine that Mr. Duncan is not  
21 competent to assist in his defense and, therefore, not  
22 competent to stand trial; isn't that correct?

23 A. That is correct.

24 Q. Because of these persistent delusions that interfere  
25 with his ability to focus?



J. Volin, M.D. - Cross

1 A. Yes, so the delusion and the thought  
2 disorganization.

3 Q. Would your opinion change if Mr. Duncan had been  
4 able to sit in court today, pay attention, assimilate  
5 all the information of witness testimony and interact  
6 with his attorneys in an organized and coherent fashion?

7 A. I would have to evaluate Mr. Duncan. I would be  
8 particularly interested in whether or not he continued  
9 to believe that his counsel, that the judge in this  
10 case, that other court professionals were involved in  
11 the conspiracy with Robert Rose, that Robert Rose was  
12 directly involved in his incarceration. So it would be  
13 very important to me to make sure that those delusions  
14 were either present or not present.

15 One's decorum in court does not necessarily mean  
16 that delusions are no longer present.

17 MS. HARRIS: Your Honor, may I confer with  
18 cocounsel?

19 THE COURT: You may.

20 MS. HARRIS: Thank you very much, Dr. Volin. I  
21 have no further questions. Have a good afternoon.

22 MS. STERLING: I have just one question, Your  
23 Honor.

24 THE COURT: Okay. One brief redirect  
25 question.

1 MS. STERLING: One brief redirect question.

2 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

3 BY MS. STERLING:

4 Q. Dr. Volin, can you state with a reasonable degree of  
5 medical certainty that Mr. Duncan does not meet the  
6 criteria for delusional disorder?

7 A. Yes.

8 MS. STERLING: Thank you.

9 THE COURT: May this witness be permanently  
10 excused, ladies?

11 MS. HARRIS: No, sir, Your Honor.

12 THE COURT: You do not wish to permanently  
13 excuse her?

14 MS. HARRIS: We have no objection to her being  
15 excused, Your Honor.

16 THE COURT: That's what I was asking.  
17 You may be permanently excused, Dr. Volin.

18 THE WITNESS: Thank you, Your Honor.

19 (The witness was excused.)

20 THE COURT: Do you have another witness?

21 MS. STERLING: Your Honor, the Government would  
22 not call our remaining witness. As I indicated before,  
23 it was only if a question was raised as to something that  
24 came up. We would rest at this time.

25 THE COURT: If you intend to call any witnesses,

1 the Court is going to have to take a break.

2 Do you intend to call any witnesses?

3 MS. TALLENT: No, sir, Your Honor.

4 THE COURT: All right. If you are not calling  
5 any witnesses and the defendant is not calling any  
6 witnesses, here's what the Court is going to do.

7 THE DEFENDANT: May I save the taxpayer  
8 dollars? There's a robbery report that Bashama--

9 THE COURT: No, we are not going to do it this  
10 way.

11 THE DEFENDANT: Bashama robbed my business of  
12 four contracts.

13 THE COURT: Mr. Duncan, you will not address the  
14 Court. You will go through your counsel. If your  
15 counsel doesn't raise it--

16 THE DEFENDANT: She needs to admit it into  
17 evidence.

18 THE COURT: That's because she is trained, and  
19 she knows what needs to be--

20 THE DEFENDANT: She is refusing to admit  
21 evidence. The area police department report proves--  
22 it's her job, and she is not doing it.

23 THE COURT: No. It is her job and not yours, so  
24 be quiet.

25 THE DEFENDANT: That's correct.

1           You do it.

2           THE COURT: She is not going to do it.

3           THE DEFENDANT: Why?

4           THE COURT: Because she is in charge of the  
5 case, not you, and the Court relies on counsel, not an  
6 untrained person.

7           THE DEFENDANT: I have fired her so many times,  
8 and she refuses to pass my information to the FBI.

9           THE COURT: Here's where we stand. I want you  
10 to deliver any post-argument memoranda you wish to  
11 present to the Court within 20 days of today. Today is--  
12 within 20 days of today-- you can calculate 20 days from  
13 today's date --in writing, and the Court will promptly  
14 get back to you probably within 20 days with its ruling  
15 on the issue raised here on the question of involuntary  
16 medication.

17           THE DEFENDANT: I will continue giving my  
18 information to the FBI.

19           THE COURT: The Court will be in recess.

20           THE DEFENDANT: Put that on the record, please.

21           (This hearing concluded at 2:03 p.m.)

22

23

\* \* \*

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATION

I certify that the foregoing is a correct transcript of the record of proceedings in the above-entitled matter.

X \_\_\_\_\_ /s/ \_\_\_\_\_ X

Sharon B. Borden, RMR, FCRR

X August 27, 2019 X

Date